GEORGE B. BACON
Director
Idaho Department of Lands
954 W. Jefferson Street
P.O. Box 83720
Boise, Idaho 83720-0050

BEFORE THE STATE BOARD OF LAND COMMISSIONERS STATE OF IDAHO

In the Matter of;	)	
Encroachment Permit No. L-95-S-5149 Big Rock Timber & Development, LLC.	) FINAL ORDE	≅R
Applicant.	) ) )	

#### I. NATURE OF PROCEEDINGS/ISSUES

A reconsideration hearing was held on May 29, 2007 at 6:00 pm PST at the Idaho Department of Lands office in Coeur d'Alene, Idaho. Mike Murphy served as Hearing Coordinator. The Hearing Coordinator issued his Recommendations on August 24, 2007.

My responsibility is to render a decision on the behalf of the State Board of Land Commissioners based on the record reviewed in the context of my personal expertise gained through education, training and experience. In making this determination I have relied on the record provided. Specifically,

- I have read the transcript of the public hearing conducted in Coeur d'Alene, Idaho on May 29, 2007.
- I have reviewed the record including all documents and exhibits.
- I have examined the Hearing Coordinator's Recommendations in light of the entire record.

Encroachments, including docks, placed on the navigable waters require a permit

issued by the Department of Lands pursuant to the requirements of Title 58, Chapter

13, Idaho Code and the Rules for the Regulation of Beds, Waters and Airspace over

Navigable Lakes in the State of Idaho, IDAPA 20.03.04, as promulgated by the State

Board of Land Commissioners.

II. FINDINGS OF FACT

I concur with the Findings of Fact presented by the Hearing Coordinator.

III. **CONCLUSIONS OF LAW** 

I concur with the Conclusions of Law presented by the Hearing Coordinator.

IV. FINAL ORDER

On the basis of the record, it is my order that Encroachment Permit L-95-S-5149

be approved and the permit be issued by the Mica Supervisory Area to the Applicant,

subject to the following condition:

Prior to approval, Applicant and the Inland Northwest Council of Boy Scouts of

America shall submit to the IDL their written agreement regarding the use of

Gotham Bay to be incorporated by reference into the encroachment permit.

Adherence to this agreement shall be a requirement of the permit.

This is a final order of the agency.

DATED this <u>3ott</u> day of August, 2007.

Director

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I HEREBY CERTIFY that on this <u>30 h</u> day of August, 2007, I caused to be served a true and correct copy of the foregoing document, by the method indicated:

Nick Krema Idaho Department of Lands 954 W. Jefferson Boise, ID 83720-0050	<ul> <li>□ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>★ Hand Delivery</li> <li>□ Federal Express</li> <li>□ Facsimile:</li> <li>□ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Mr. Jim Magnuson 1250 Northwood Center Ct Coeur d'Alene, ID 83814	<ul> <li>▶ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>□ Hand Delivery</li> <li>□ Federal Express</li> <li>□ Facsimile:</li> <li>□ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Mr. Steven Hersrud 10776 N. Magic Ct. Hayden, ID 83835	<ul> <li>U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>☐ Hand Delivery</li> <li>☐ Federal Express</li> <li>☐ Facsimile:</li> <li>☐ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Mr. Jes W. Erling 7508 North Heartland Drive Coeur d'Alene, ID 83814	U.S. Mail, postage prepaid  ☐ Hand Delivery  ☐ Federal Express  ☐ Facsimile:  ☐ Statehouse Mail
Mr. Tim McCandless 411 W. Boy Scout Way Spokane, WA 99201	<ul> <li>↓ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>☐ Hand Delivery</li> <li>☐ Federal Express</li> <li>☐ Facsimile:</li> <li>☐ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Jackie McNamara 5223 S Catamaran Harrison, ID 83833	<ul> <li>∠ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>☐ Hand Delivery</li> <li>☐ Federal Express</li> <li>☐ Facsimile:</li> <li>☐ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>

Barbara A. Dennis PO Box 2323 Coeur d'Alene, ID 83816	<ul> <li>U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>☐ Hand Delivery</li> <li>☐ Federal Express</li> <li>☐ Facsimile:</li> <li>☐ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Dick L. Swart 1021 N. 2 <sup>nd</sup> St. Coeur d'Alene, ID 83814	<ul> <li>☑ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>☐ Hand Delivery</li> <li>☐ Federal Express</li> <li>☐ Facsimile:</li> <li>☐ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Scott W. Reed PO Box A Coeur d'Alene ID 83816	<ul> <li>U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>☐ Hand Delivery</li> <li>☐ Federal Express</li> <li>☐ Facsimile:</li> <li>☐ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Linda VanFleet 733 E. Pine Ridge Dr. Harrison, ID 83833	U.S. Mail, postage prepaid  Hand Delivery  Federal Express  Facsimile:  Statehouse Mail
Laurie A. Frank 1968 E. Gotham Bay Road Harrison, ID 83833	<ul> <li>♥ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>□ Hand Delivery</li> <li>□ Federal Express</li> <li>□ Facsimile:</li> <li>□ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Bev Twillmann 15143 S. Asbury Rd. Harrison, ID 83833	<ul> <li>□ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>□ Hand Delivery</li> <li>□ Federal Express</li> <li>□ Facsimile:</li> <li>□ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Linda Johnson 12881 S. Stormy Point Lane Harrison, ID 83833	U.S. Mail, postage prepaid  Hand Delivery  Federal Express  Facsimile:  Statehouse Mail
David H. Wardsworth 9261 S. Gozzer Road Harrison, ID 83833	<ul> <li>▶ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>□ Hand Delivery</li> <li>□ Federal Express</li> <li>□ Facsimile:</li> </ul>

Tom E. Little 1427 E. Gotham Bay Road Harrison, ID 83833	MSo Statehouse Mail  U.S. Mail, postage prepaid  Hand Delivery  Federal Express  Facsimile:  Statehouse Mail
Howard L. Harder 593 E. Pine Ridge Dr. Harrison, ID 83833	<ul> <li>□ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>□ Hand Delivery</li> <li>□ Federal Express</li> <li>□ Facsimile:</li> <li>□ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Sylvia B. Lampard 31545 S. Highway 97 Harrison, ID 83833	<ul> <li>☑ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>☐ Hand Delivery</li> <li>☐ Federal Express</li> <li>☐ Facsimile:</li> <li>☐ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
James J. Norconk, Jr. 901 E. Pine Ridge Dr. Harrison, ID 83833	<ul> <li>□ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>□ Hand Delivery</li> <li>□ Federal Express</li> <li>□ Facsimile:</li> <li>□ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Tamera L. Fredy 1009 N. Adkins Dr. Post Falls, ID 83854	<ul> <li>□ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>□ Hand Delivery</li> <li>□ Federal Express</li> <li>□ Facsimile:</li> <li>□ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Joan Orr 838 N. 7 <sup>th</sup> St. Coeur d'Alene, ID 83814	U.S. Mail, postage prepaid Hand Delivery Federal Express Facsimile: Statehouse Mail
Paul R. Checketts 1803 E. 2 <sup>nd</sup> Ave. Post Falls, ID 83854	<ul> <li>□ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>□ Hand Delivery</li> <li>□ Federal Express</li> <li>□ Facsimile:</li> <li>□ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>

Jim Trittin 7701 S. Jo Lee Lane Harrison, ID 83833	☐ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid ☐ Hand Delivery ☐ Federal Express ☐ Facsimile: ☐ Statehouse Mail
Ryan N. Foses 2665 W. Broadmoore Dr. Hayden, ID 83835	U.S. Mail, postage prepaid  Hand Delivery  Federal Express  Facsimile:  Statehouse Mail
Myra M. Sherman 8169 S. Jeni Lane Harrison, ID 83833	<ul> <li>✓ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>☐ Hand Delivery</li> <li>☐ Federal Express</li> <li>☐ Facsimile:</li> <li>☐ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Chad J. Johnson PO Box 2791 Post Falls, ID 83877	<ul> <li>U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>☐ Hand Delivery</li> <li>☐ Federal Express</li> <li>☐ Facsimile:</li> <li>☐ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Susan M. Allman 12861 S. Stormy Point Lane Harrison, ID 83833	<ul> <li>□ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>□ Hand Delivery</li> <li>□ Federal Express</li> <li>□ Facsimile:</li> <li>□ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Rachel A. Wickham 23516 S. Highway 97 Harrison, ID 83833	U.S. Mail, postage prepaid Hand Delivery Federal Express Facsimile: Statehouse Mail
Tom E. Frey 10364 Morris Road Hayden, ID 83835	U.S. Mail, postage prepaid  ☐ Hand Delivery  ☐ Federal Express  ☐ Facsimile:  ☐ Statehouse Mail

Janet Torline 1802 E. Litten Lane Harrison, ID 83833	<ul> <li>U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>☐ Hand Delivery</li> <li>☐ Federal Express</li> <li>☐ Facsimile:</li> <li>☐ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Todd Lund 6889 S. Svenska Lane Coeur d'Alene, ID 83814	<ul> <li>U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>☐ Hand Delivery</li> <li>☐ Federal Express</li> <li>☐ Facsimile:</li> <li>☐ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Scott S. Dickinson 411 S. 12th St. Coeur d'Alene, ID 83814	<ul> <li>U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>☐ Hand Delivery</li> <li>☐ Federal Express</li> <li>☐ Facsimile:</li> <li>☐ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Charles E. Corsi Idaho Dept. of Fish and Game 2885 W. Kathleen Ave. Coeur d'Alene, ID 83815	U.S. Mail, postage prepaid Hand Delivery Federal Express Facsimile: Statehouse Mail
Ron Meldrum 18255 E. Nuthatch Lane Harrison, ID 83833	<ul> <li>□ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>□ Hand Delivery</li> <li>□ Federal Express</li> <li>□ Facsimile:</li> <li>□ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
James Fedewitz 905 East Kurt Road Harrison, ID 83833	<ul> <li>U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>☐ Hand Delivery</li> <li>☐ Federal Express</li> <li>☐ Facsimile:</li> <li>☐ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Mike Denney Department of Lands 3706 Industrial Avenue South Coeur d'Alene ID 83815	<ul> <li>U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>☐ Hand Delivery</li> <li>☐ Federal Express</li> <li>☐ Facsimile:</li> <li>☐ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>

	U.S. Mail, post	age prepaid
George Bacon	☐ Hand Delivery	
Idaho Department of Lands	☐ Federal Express	3
954 W. Jefferson	☐ Facsimile:	
Boise, ID 83720-0050	☐ Statehouse Mai	1

MIKE MURPHY
IDL Bureau Chief of Surface and Mineral Resources

BUREAU OF SURFACE AND MINERAL RESOURCES

954 West Jefferson Post Office Box 83720 Boise ID 83720-0050 Phone (208) 334-0200 Fax (208) 334-3698



EQUAL OPPORTUNITY EMPLOYER

STATE BOARD OF LAND COMMISSIONERS

C. L. "Butch" Otter, Governor Ben Ysursa, Secretary of State Lawrence G. Wasden, Attorney General Donna M. Jones, State Controller Tom Luna, Sup't of Public Instruction

August 24, 2007

#### **MEMORANDUM**

TO:

George B. Bacon, Director

FROM:

Mike Murphy, Bureau Chief, Surface and Mineral Resources

SUBJECT:

Reconsideration Hearing - Community Dock for Big Rock Timber &

Development, LLC L-95-S-5149

## I. INTRODUCTION

The following document, which includes a recommendation for your consideration, was prepared following a reconsideration hearing conducted by the Idaho Department of Lands (IDL). This hearing was conducted in conjunction with the processing of an encroachment permit for a community dock on Lake Coeur d'Alene, a navigable lake in Idaho. Jurisdiction in this matter rests with IDL pursuant to Idaho Code § 58-1303, which empowers the State Board of Land Commissioners to regulate, control, and permit encroachments on, in, or above the beds or waters of the navigable lakes of Idaho.

### **II. FINDINGS OF FACT**

- 1. On December 22, 2006, Big Rock Timber & Development, LLC (Applicant) submitted to IDL an encroachment permit application (L-95-S-5149) requesting the approval to construct a community dock on Lake Coeur d'Alene. The application is incorporated into this document by reference.
- 2. IDL initiated the processing of the encroachment permit application as a navigational encroachment pursuant to the Lake Protection Act (Idaho Code § 58-1306) and the associated Rules (IDAPA 20.03.04.030). A public hearing for this application was held on March 14, 2007. Mr. Eric Wilson, IDL Program Manager, served as the hearing coordinator. Mr. Wilson developed a written recommendation, dated April 9, 2007, for consideration by Mr. George Bacon, IDL Director. Mr. Bacon issued a Final Order, dated April 12, 2007, stating that an encroachment permit for a community dock should be issued to Applicant, subject to specific conditions related to the nearby Boy Scout Camp. The Final Order, the written recommendation, and the hearing record are incorporated into this document by reference.
- 3. A request for reconsideration of the Final Order for Encroachment Application L-95-S-5149 was submitted to IDL by Attorney Mr. Scott Reed dated April 30, 2007. The letter indicated Mr. Reed was representing Mr. James J. Norconk, Jr. and additional members of the public that attended the initial public hearing. The grounds for reconsideration cited in the letter were: safety concerns with the Boy Scout Camp, Fish and Game testimony, parking and road safety, water rights issues, dock size, riparian ownership, and disregarded hearing testimony. The letter of request is incorporated

into this document by reference.

- 4. In a letter dated May 9, 2007, IDL notified the following parties that a reconsideration hearing for Encroachment Application L-95-S-5149 would be held:
  - Mr. Tim McCandless;
  - Mr. Jim Trittin;
  - Ms. Jackie McNamara;
  - Mr. Dick Swart;
  - Mr. James Norconk, Jr.;
  - Ms. Joan Orr;
  - Ms. Sylvia Lampard;
  - Ms. Tamera Freddy;
  - Mr. Paul Checketts;
  - Mr. Jes Erling;
  - Ms. Bev Twilmann;
  - Mr. David Wardsworth;
  - Mr. Tom Little;
  - Mr. Howard Harder;
  - Mr. Steven Hersrud;
  - Ms. Linda Johnson;
  - Mr. Scott Reed;
  - Ms. Linda Van Fleet;
  - Ms. Laurie Frank;
  - Mr. Ron Meldrum;

- Mr. James Fedwitz;
- Mr. James Magnuson; and
- Applicant.

These individuals testified at the original public hearing held on March 14, 2007. The letter is incorporated into this document by reference.

- 5. A reconsideration hearing for Encroachment Application L-95-S-5149 was held at 6 pm on May 29, 2007 in IDL's Coeur d'Alene staff office. Mike Murphy, Bureau Chief of Surface and Mineral Resources, acted as the hearing coordinator. In attendance were Mike Denney, IDL Area Manager; Mr. Carl Washburn, IDL Navigable Waters Specialist; Applicant and several members of the public. The transcript of the hearing is incorporated into this document by reference. IDL also received written comments from several individuals eligible to testify at the hearing. These letters are incorporated into this document by reference. A multi-media presentation was presented by Mr. Norconk.
- 6. The testimony provided by the public, both in verbal and written form, can be summarized by reviewing the points made by Mr. Scott Reed, attorney for the parties which called for the public hearing. According to Mr. Reed and the collective testimony of the objecting parties, the following issues surround the potential permitting of the community dock:
  - Navigation The presence of the community docks will increase boat traffic in Gotham Bay and will impact use of the bay by the Boy Scout Camp. This will increase the burden of the marine patrol.

- Fish Habitat and Aquatic Life The community dock will be placed in front of the outlet to Gotham Bay and will impact Kokanee spawning. IDL ignored previous Fish and Game testimony.
- Recreation The recreational use of the bay will be adversely impacted by the presence of the encroachment and the associated boats.
- Aesthetic Beauty Applicant has recently violated the Kootenai County Site
  Disturbance Ordinance by removing vegetation from the shoreline associated
  with the proposed community dock. The size of the proposed community dock
  was not limited based on its impact on private property, fish habitat, aquatic life
  and aesthetic beauty.
- Water Quality The presence of the additional boats and potential fuel spills associated with the proposed community dock will adversely impact water quality.
- On-Shore Impact The presence of the community dock will create an unsafe situation where pedestrian traffic will need to cross Highway 97 to reach the proposed community dock. IDL did not consider parking and pedestrian safety.
   Additionally IDL did not consider established water rights.

Because of the issues delineated above, Mr. Reed and the testifying objectors requested that the application for the proposed community dock be denied.

7. Mr. Jim Magnuson, attorney representing Applicant, provided testimony indicating that although any existing water rights issues will be resolved, they are outside of the jurisdiction of the encroachment permitting process. Mr. Magnuson

indicated that Applicant has worked with ITD and Kootenai County regarding pedestrian traffic, vehicle traffic and parking and have obtained the appropriate subdivision approvals which consider these issues. Mr. Magnuson indicated that Fish and Game has provided no testimony which indicates the proposed community dock will adversely impact fish habitat. Mr. Magnuson indicated that Applicant and the Boy Scout have reached a cooperative agreement related to boat traffic, safety and interactions with the Boy Scout camp.

#### III. CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. The Idaho Board of Land Commissioners (Board) is designated in Idaho Code § 58-104(9) and § 58-1303 to regulate, corntrol and permit encroachments on, in, or above the beds of navigable lakes in the state of Idaho. IDL is the administrative agency of the Board, as per Idaho Code § 58-119.
- 2. Lake Coeur d'Alene is a navigable lake as defined by Idaho Code § 58-1302(a). Pursuant to IDAPA 20.03.04.011.02, encroachments of any kind on, in, or above the beds of a navigable lake require a permit prior to encroaching on the lake.
- 3. Gotham Creek is not a navigable stream as recognized by the State of Idaho, and is therefore outside the jurisdiction of IDL. The Idaho Department of Water Resources administers the Stream Channel Protection Act (Title 42, Chapter 38, Idaho Code) which may apply to Gotham Creek.
- 4. Pursuant to Idaho Code § 58-1301, lake encroachments must be regulated to

protect property and the lake value factors of navigation, fish and wildlife habitat, aquatic life, recreation, aesthetic beauty, and water quality. These values must be given due consideration and weighed against the navigational or economic necessity or justification for, or benefit to be derived from, the proposed encroachment.

- 5. IDL shall make decisions on proposed encroachments in accordance with the Public Trust Doctrine as set forth in Idaho Code § 58-1201 through 1203. This statute protects the property rights of private land owners, including the ability to utilize their riparian rights as a means to access the waters of the navigable lakes of Idaho.
- 6. IDL shall also make decisions on proposed encroachments in accordance with the Public Trust Doctrine as explained by the Idaho Supreme Court in Kootenai Environmental Alliance, Inc. v. Panhandle Yacht Club, Inc., 105 Idaho 622, 671 P.2d 1085 (1983) (KEA) and subsequent cases. The court in KEA stated that encroachment permits and submerged land leases remain subject to the public trust, and are not irretrievable commitments. The court in KEA also stated that mere compliance of IDL with its' legislative authority is not sufficient to determine if their actions comport with the requirements of the public trust doctrine.
- 7. IDAPA 20.03.04.015.03b limits the surface decking area of a community dock to seven (7) square feet per lineal foot of shoreline owned by the applicant. The applicant in this instance owns 441.15 feet of littoral frontage. The proposed dock has 3,081 square feet, which is in compliance with the cited rule.

- 8. IDAPA 20.03.04.060.05 establishes a twenty-five (25) foot setback from adjacent littoral property for community docks. The applicant's dock will be 41 feet from the eastern property line and 131 feet from the western property line, so this standard appears to have been met.
- 9. The Idaho Department of Fish and Game stated a concern that the design of the dock should be changed so it would not act as a breakwater. The applicant stated that the dock would be floating and would not contain a breakwater under the dock.
- 10. When permitting community docks, no authority is delegated to IDL over roads, road safety, and parking areas, and the applicant has satisfied the requirements of the Idaho Transportation Department, the Eastside Highway District, and the Kootenai County Planning and Zoning Commission.
- 11. Idaho law, including Idaho Code § 58-1301 et. seq. (the Lake Protection Act), delegates no authority to IDL for the regulation of boats and water craft. Water craft are regulated by the United States Coast Guard through the Idaho Department of Parks and Recreation and local County Sheriff's Departments.
- 12. Kootenai County Waterways Ordinance No. 279D, Section 6 Limits for Certain Waterways establishes a 5 mph "no-wake" zone within 100' of shoreline, docks, and structures for Lake Coeur d'Alene.

13. Applicant and IDL satisfied all procedural requirements in the processing of the application included in Idaho Code § 58-1306 and IDAPA 20.03.04.

## IV. HEARING COORDINATOR CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

According to the Lake Protection Act all navigational encroachments must be regulated in order to protect the public health, safety, and welfare (Idaho Code § 58-1301). In order to properly exercise that regulatory authority, IDL must weigh the protection of property, navigation, fish and wildlife habitat, aquatic life, recreation, aesthetic beauty, and water quality against the navigational and economic necessity of the encroachment. In processing Applicant's request for a community dock encroachment permit, IDL has successfully met the obligations set forth in the Lake Protection Act as demonstrated by the record established in the original public hearing. This is further demonstrated by the record established in this reconsideration hearing process including the following responses to the objections outlined by Mr. Reed and the collective objecting parties:

#### Navigation

**Objection:** The presence of the community docks will increase boat traffic in Gotham Bay and will impact use of the bay by the Boy Scout Camp. This will increase the burden of the marine patrol.

**Response:** IDL recognizes that anytime a new single-family, two-family, community or commercial dock is permitted, it will have some impact on navigation. This impact, however, has to be balanced by the public's right to use public waterways and the ability of littoral property owners to "wharf out" to extent

allowed by the Lake Protection Act. Existing Idaho law, including the Lake Protection Act and the associated IDAPA Rules, does not provide IDL with the authority to limit the number of encroachments on a given navigable lake. Absent changes to existing Idaho law, the public must rely on county zoning and comprehensive planning or perhaps other local, state or federal agencies to

regulate development densities. Additionally IDL has no statutory authority to

regulate boat traffic.

#### • Fish Habitat and Aquatic Life

**Objection:** The community dock will be placed in front of the outlet to Gotham Bay and will impact Kokanee spawning. IDL ignored previous Fish and Game testimony.

Response: All testimony provided by Idaho Fish and Game was considered. Although the testimony of the public may differ, IDL must rely extensively on "sister" agencies such as Idaho Fish and Game to provide the technical assistance necessary to make informed and consistent permitting decisions. Idaho Fish and Game provided no testimony or evidence suggesting that the proposed community dock should not be permitted due to impacts on fish habitat and aquatic life.

#### Recreation

**Objection:** The recreational use of the bay will be adversely impacted by the presence of the encroachment and the associated boats.

Response: IDL recognizes that anytime a new single-family, two-family,

community or commercial dock is permitted, it will have some impact on recreation. This impact, however, has to be balanced by the public's right to use public waterways and the ability of littoral property owners to "wharf out" to extent allowed by the Lake Protection Act. Existing Idaho law, including the Lake Protection Act and the associated IDAPA Rules, do not provide IDL with the authority to limit the number of encroachments on a given navigable lake.

### Aesthetic Beauty

**Objection:** Applicant has recently violated the Kootenai County Site Disturbance Ordinance by removing vegetation from the shoreline associated with the proposed community dock. The size of the proposed community dock was not limited based on its impact on private property, fish habitat, aquatic life and aesthetic beauty.

**Response:** IDL has no jurisdiction above the ordinary high water mark of navigable lakes in Idaho and any violations of the Kootenai County Site Disturbance Ordinance have no bearing on the encroachment permitting process.

Applicant's property contains 441.15 feet of littoral frontage, which according to IDAPA 20.03.04.015.03.b, allows a maximum community dock of 3,088 square feet. The proposed community dock is less than 3,088 square feet. IDAPA 20.03.04.015.03.b does allow IDL to limit the ultimate size of a proposed community dock based on public trust values. In this case, however, those public trust values have been evaluated against the installation of the proposed community dock and IDL finds no compelling evidence or measurable benefit in

reducing the proposed square footage of the community dock.

## Water Quality

**Objection:** The presence of the additional boats and potential fuel spills associated with the proposed community dock will adversely impact water quality.

Response: IDL recognizes that anytime a new single-family, two-family, community or commercial dock is permitted, it will have some impact on water quality. This impact, however, has to be balanced by the public's right to use public waterways and the ability of littoral property owners to "wharf out" to extent allowed by the Lake Protection Act. IDL must rely on "sister" agencies such as the Idaho Department of Environmental Quality (DEQ) to provide technical insight into the impacts of encroachments and the use of public waterways on water quality. Neither DEQ nor any other agency provided testimony indicating that the installation of this community dock would result in water quality impacts significant enough to warrant permit denial.

#### On-Shore Impact

**Objection:** The presence of the community dock will create an unsafe situation where pedestrian traffic will need to cross Highway 97 to reach the proposed community dock. IDL did not consider parking and pedestrian safety. Additionally IDL did not consider established easement and water rights.

Response: Existing Idaho law, including the Lake Protection Act and the associated IDAPA Rules, does not provide IDL with the authority to regulate

traffic or parking related to community docks. IDL and the public must rely on

Kootenai County and the Idaho Transportation Department (ITD) to exercise their

own authority to ensure the public's safety.

As stated in the hearing coordinator's decision document for the original public

hearing, dated April 9, 2007, the easement on privately owned uplands is a

property issue between Mr. Norconk and Applicant and has no bearing on the

encroachment permitting process.

Based upon the information provided to me as the hearing coordinator and based upon

the fact that the encroachment permit application for the community dock meets all the

requirements of Idaho Code § 58-1301 et. seq. (the Lake Protection Act) and IDAPA

20.03.04, I recommend that the Director of IDL issue a Final Order stating that the Mica

Supervisory Area should approve the proposed encroachment permit, subject to the

following condition:

Prior to approval. Applicant and the Inland Northwest Council of Boy Scouts of

America shall submit to the IDL their written agreement regarding the use of

Gotham Bay to be incorporated by reference into the encroachment permit.

Adherence to this agreement shall be a requirement of the permit.

DATED this 24th

day of August, 2007

MIKE MURPHY

Hearing Coordinator

# **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I HEREBY CERTIFY that on this 35 day of August, 2007, I caused to be served a true and correct copy of the foregoing document, by the method indicated:

Nick Krema Idaho Department of Lands 954 W. Jefferson Boise, ID 83720-0050	<ul> <li>□ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>★ Hand Delivery</li> <li>□ Federal Express</li> <li>□ Facsimile:</li> <li>□ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Mr. Jim Magnuson 1250 Northwood Center Ct Coeur d'Alene, ID 83814	<ul> <li>★ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>Hand Delivery</li> <li>Federal Express</li> <li>Facsimile:</li> <li>Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Mr. Steven Hersrud 10776 N. Magic Ct. Hayden, ID 83835	<ul> <li>U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>☐ Hand Delivery</li> <li>☐ Federal Express</li> <li>☐ Facsimile:</li> <li>☐ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Mr. Jes W. Erling 7508 North Heartland Drive Coeur d'Alene, ID 83814	<ul> <li>▶ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>□ Hand Delivery</li> <li>□ Federal Express</li> <li>□ Facsimile:</li> <li>□ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Mr. Tim McCandless 411 W. Boy Scout Way Spokane, WA 99201	<ul> <li>U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>Hand Delivery</li> <li>Federal Express</li> <li>Facsimile:</li> <li>Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Jackie McNamara 5223 S Catamaran Harrison, ID 83833	<ul> <li>U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>☐ Hand Delivery</li> <li>☐ Federal Express</li> <li>☐ Facsimile:</li> <li>☐ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>

Barbara A. Dennis PO Box 2323 Coeur d'Alene, ID 83816	<ul> <li>U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>☐ Hand Delivery</li> <li>☐ Federal Express</li> <li>☐ Facsimile:</li> <li>☐ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Dick L. Swart 1021 N. 2 <sup>nd</sup> St. Coeur d'Alene, ID 83814	U.S. Mail, postage prepaid Hand Delivery Federal Express Facsimile: Statehouse Mail
Scott W. Reed PO Box A Coeur d'Alene ID 83816	<ul> <li>♥ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>□ Hand Delivery</li> <li>□ Federal Express</li> <li>□ Facsimile:</li> <li>□ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Linda VanFleet 733 E. Pine Ridge Dr. Harrison, ID 83833	<ul> <li>U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>⊢ Hand Delivery</li> <li>⊢ Federal Express</li> <li>⊢ Facsimile:</li> <li>⊢ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Laurie A. Frank 1968 E. Gotham Bay Road Harrison, ID 83833	<ul> <li>U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>☐ Hand Delivery</li> <li>☐ Federal Express</li> <li>☐ Facsimile:</li> <li>☐ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Bev Twillmann 15143 S. Asbury Rd. Harrison, ID 83833	U.S. Mail, postage prepaid  ☐ Hand Delivery  ☐ Federal Express  ☐ Facsimile:  ☐ Statehouse Mail  D U.S. Mail, postage prepaid
Linda Johnson 12881 S. Stormy Point Lane Harrison, ID 83833	Hand Delivery Federal Express Facsimile: Statehouse Mail
David H. Wardsworth 9261 S. Gozzer Road Harrison, ID 83833	U.S. Mail, postage prepaid  ☐ Hand Delivery  ☐ Federal Express  ☐ Facsimile:  ☐ Statehouse Mail  ☐ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid

Tom E. Little 1427 E. Gotham Bay Road	<ul><li></li></ul>
Harrison, ID 83833	☐ Facsimile: ☐ Statehouse Mail
Howard L. Harder 593 E. Pine Ridge Dr. Harrison, ID 83833	<ul> <li>♥ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>□ Hand Delivery</li> <li>□ Federal Express</li> <li>□ Facsimile:</li> <li>□ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Sylvia B. Lampard 31545 S. Highway 97 Harrison, ID 83833	<ul> <li>□ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>□ Hand Delivery</li> <li>□ Federal Express</li> <li>□ Facsimile:</li> <li>□ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
James J. Norconk, Jr. 901 E. Pine Ridge Dr. Harrison, ID 83833	<ul> <li>U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>☐ Hand Delivery</li> <li>☐ Federal Express</li> <li>☐ Facsimile:</li> <li>☐ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Tamera L. Fredy 1009 N. Adkins Dr. Post Falls, ID 83854	U.S. Mail, postage prepaid  Hand Delivery  Federal Express  Facsimile:  Statehouse Mail
Joan Orr 838 N. 7 <sup>th</sup> St. Coeur d'Alene, ID 83814	<ul> <li>U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>☐ Hand Delivery</li> <li>☐ Federal Express</li> <li>☐ Facsimile:</li> <li>☐ Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Paul R. Checketts 1803 E. 2 <sup>nd</sup> Ave. Post Falls, ID 83854	<ul> <li>U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>Hand Delivery</li> <li>Federal Express</li> <li>Facsimile:</li> <li>Statehouse Mail</li> </ul>
Jim Trittin 7701 S. Jo Lee Lane Harrison, ID 83833	<ul> <li>U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> <li>☐ Hand Delivery</li> <li>☐ Federal Express</li> <li>☐ Facsimile:</li> <li>☐ Statehouse Mail</li> <li>☐ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid</li> </ul>

Ryan N. Foses	Hand Delivery
2665 W. Broadmoore Dr.	☐ Federal Express
Hayden, ID 83835	☐ Facsimile:
	☐ Statehouse Mail
	U.S. Mail, postage prepaid
Myra M. Sherman	☐ Hand Delivery
8169 S. Jeni Lane	☐ Federal Express
Harrison, ID 83833	☐ Facsimile:
·	☐ Statehouse Mail
	U.S. Mail, postage prepaid
Chad J. Johnson	☐ Hand Delivery
PO Box 2791	☐ Federal Express
Post Falls, ID 83877	☐ Facsimile:
• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	☐ Statehouse Mail
	☑ U.S. Mail, postage prepaid
Susan M. Allman	☐ Hand Delivery
12861 S. Stormy Point Lane	☐ Federal Express
Harrison, ID 83833	☐ Facsimile:
1141115011, 12 03 03 3	□ Statehouse Mail
D 1 1 4 W 11	U.S. Mail, postage prepaid
Rachel A. Wickham	☐ Hand Delivery
23516 S. Highway 97	☐ Federal Express
Harrison, ID 83833	☐ Facsimile:
	☐ Statehouse Mail
	U.S. Mail, postage prepaid
Tom E. Frey	☐ Hand Delivery
10364 Morris Road	☐ Federal Express
Hayden, ID 83835	☐ Facsimile:
	☐ Statehouse Mail
	Sp U.S. Mail, postage prepaid
Janet Torline	☐ Hand Delivery
1802 E. Litten Lane	☐ Federal Express
Harrison, ID 83833	☐ Facsimile:
	☐ Statehouse Mail
	U.S. Mail, postage prepaid
Todd Lund	<ul><li>Hand Delivery</li></ul>
6889 S. Svenska Lane	☐ Federal Express
Coeur d'Alene, ID 83814	☐ Facsimile:
	☐ Statehouse Mail

	Y U.S. Mail, postage prepaid
Scott S. Dickinson	☐ Hand Delivery
411 S. 12th St.	☐ Federal Express
Coeur d'Alene, ID 83814	☐ Facsimile:
00000 0 1110110, 12 00 01 1	☐ Statehouse Mail
	_ StateMouse Wall
	U.S. Mail, postage prepaid
Charles E. Corsi	☐ Hand Delivery
Idaho Dept. of Fish and Game	☐ Federal Express
2885 W. Kathleen Ave.	☐ Facsimile:
Coeur d'Alene, ID 83815	☐ Statehouse Mail
	U.S. Mail, postage prepaid
Ron Meldrum	☐ Hand Delivery
18255 E. Nuthatch Lane	☐ Federal Express
Harrison, ID 83833	☐ Facsimile:
,	☐ Statehouse Mail
	U.S. Mail, postage prepaid
James Fedewitz	☐ Hand Delivery
905 East Kurt Road	☐ Federal Express
Harrison, ID 83833	☐ Facsimile:
1141110011, 12 00 000	☐ Statehouse Mail
	_ StateModSe Man
	U.S. Mail, postage prepaid
Mike Denney	☐ Hand Delivery
Department of Lands	☐ Federal Express
3706 Industrial Avenue South	☐ Facsimile:
Coeur d'Alene ID 83815	☐ Statehouse Mail
	U.S. Mail, postage prepaid
George Bacon	☐ Hand Delivery
Idaho Department of Lands	☐ Federal Express
954 W. Jefferson	☐ Facsimile:
Boise, ID 83720-0050	☐ Statehouse Mail
20100, 12 00 120 0000	_ Statemonde Iviani
1	
f t	

MIKE MURCHY
IDL Bureau Chief of Surface and Mineral Resources