Department of Lands <no-reply@idl.idaho.gov> Saturday, July 25, 2020 6:50 PM Comments Comment Submitted

From: Bob Hultz at bhultz@netscape.net Phone: 2082490532 Address: 18500 Purple Sage Rd City: Caldwell State: Idaho

Comment:

If there is a shred of truth to this article in the Idaho Press Tribune, then this is an issue that's needs full disclosure and public opinion before any action is taken.

BOISE — It's one of the most iconic views in Idaho, the scenic view of the Sawtooth Mountains from Stanley, part of a national recreation area and a dark-sky reserve. But the Idaho Department of Lands is preparing to issue a lease for a giant, 195-foot-tall cell tower on top of a 300-foot ridge right smack in the middle of that view, over the objections of the local county commissioners, the mayor of Stanley, the Sawtooth Society, the local search and rescue operation, and hundreds of local residents, business owners and visitors.

Cingular Wireless wants to lease a tiny, 50-by-75-foot plot of state endowment land to build the tower as part of the FirstNet cellular network, which would expand first responder emergency access along with commercial use. They'd pay about \$29,000 a year for 20 years for the privilege.

From:	Bob Hultz <bhultz@live.com></bhultz@live.com>
Sent:	Saturday, July 25, 2020 6:54 PM
То:	Sharla Arledge
Subject:	Cell tower in Stanley

If there is one shred of truth to this....it's on the level of criminal and a slap in the face to any Idahoan or visitor that has been to Stanley.

BOISE — It's one of the most iconic views in Idaho, the scenic view of the Sawtooth Mountains from Stanley, part of a national recreation area and a dark-sky reserve. But the Idaho Department of Lands is preparing to issue a lease for a giant, 195-foot-tall cell tower on top of a 300-foot ridge right smack in the middle of that view, over the objections of the local county commissioners, the mayor of Stanley, the Sawtooth Society, the local search and rescue operation, and hundreds of local residents, business owners and visitors.

Cingular Wireless wants to lease a tiny, 50-by-75-foot plot of state endowment land to build the tower as part of the FirstNet cellular network, which would expand first responder emergency access along with commercial use. They'd pay about \$29,000 a year for 20 years for the privilege.

Sent from Mail for Windows 10

Department of Lands <no-reply@idl.idaho.gov> Tuesday, July 28, 2020 8:54 AM Comments Comment Submitted

From: Hayley Noble at hayleynoble09@gmail.com Phone: 7753043071 City: Boise State: Idaho

Comment:

Good Morning,

I wanted to voice my opposition to the proposed leasing of land in the Sawtooth Mountains for a cell-tower by AT&T. The mountains are iconic and many choose to visit Stanley and the surrounding area for it's remoteness. Putting a cell tower out there would most certainly disrupt that. Additionally, the area is a dark sky reserve and should stay that way. I hope to vote against this lease.

Thanks,

Hayley Noble

Department of Lands <no-reply@idl.idaho.gov> Tuesday, July 28, 2020 12:20 PM Comments Comment Submitted

From: Rebecca Irwin at kelladry@gmail.com Phone: 2088505473 Address: 2115 S ILLINOIS AVE City: BOISE State: Idaho

Comment:

I am commenting regarding the potential new cell tower which would be located near Redfish. As someone who has been directly involved in siting communication towers in the mountains of Idaho as my full time job, the lack of foresight and flexibility on the part of the cell company to choose a location and tower design which would be of least impact to an important and job-creating viewshed (while still serving the needs of first responders), is appalling. Sometimes the most ideal option for coverage isn't the right option from a historic, environmental, or recreational point of view, all of which are of utmost importance to all the citizens of Idaho, as it both provides them with a unique quality of life, and brings money into the state and supports the survival of small towns and local businesses. The precise location and design of this type of tower can certainly be adjusted to balance the needs of the users with the needs of the general public, especially when the height could potentially impact a resource and tourism attraction as unique as the dark skies and beautiful scenery of this area. Of particular note is the option to colocate on the adjacent tower, which is significantly shorter and less impactful, and should be seriously considered, rather than dismissed out of hand. I understand the pains of colocation on another's tower, but with a well written contract and careful engineering these pains are minimized, and the small amount of pain results in huge gains for the community as a whole.

Stewart Wilder <stewartwilder@gmail.com> Wednesday, July 29, 2020 2:17 PM Renee Jacobsen ATT_FirstNet Cell Tower

Good day Director Miller,

I just wanted to follow up after last Tuesday's Land Board Meeting to see if you have had time to digest the public comments regarding an opportunity for ATT and CusterTel to come to the table on alternative solutions or next steps as you see accordingly?

Appreciate any updates on this matter. Best regards, Stewart

W. Stewart WilderPresidentLiveWilder Foundation, Idaho Suicide Prevention Coalition, Sawtooth Interpretive and Historical Association

LiveWilder Foundation 800 W Main Street, Suite 1460 Boise, ID 83702 Phone: 208.401.9263 Cell: 208.407.0842 www.livewilder.org

Idaho Suicide Prevention Coalition P.O. Box 271 Boise, ID 83701 www.IdahoSPC.org







www.discoversawtooth.org



This email has been checked for viruses by Avast antivirus software. <u>www.avast.com</u>

From:	Pamela Lowe <pamela.lowe.335228287@p2a.co></pamela.lowe.335228287@p2a.co>
Sent:	Thursday, July 30, 2020 6:34 AM
То:	Comments
Subject:	I oppose the proposed cell tower in the Sawtooth Valley!

As someone who cares deeply about the iconic landscape of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area (SNRA), I'm concerned about the new cell tower proposed in the heart of the Sawtooth Valley on land managed by the Idaho Department of Lands (lease # M700086). Although enhanced communications for first responders is an important function, the proposed cell tower undermines the core values of the SNRA and fails to take into account possible degradation of the area's designation as the Central Idaho Dark Sky Reserve.

The proposed cell tower is three times taller than surrounding trees and in direct conflict with the core values protected by Congress when they established the SNRA. These include preservation of natural, scenic, historic, pastoral, and fish and wildlife values, and to provide for the enhancement of the area's recreational values.

The proposed tower is also adjacent to the Sawtooth Scenic Byway, located between the highway and scenic forests and mountain peaks. I am also concerned that lighting associated with this tower may jeopardize this area's unique designation as an International Dark Sky Reserve, of which there are only 12 in the world.

To date, I have not had the opportunity to have my voice heard on this project. There has been no formal public comment period nor a concerted effort to involve the local community in the lease approval process. I urge the State of Idaho to make a more deliberate effort to keep me and others apprised of this project, solicit additional comments, and develop project alternatives to address the public's concern before moving forward with this proposal.

For these reasons, I implore you to withhold approval of this lease and find ways for the State of Idaho and the applicants to work together with the public and other agencies in the community to find a more appropriate solution. Any modified proposal should provide for a reasonable public comment period.

Thank you for considering my comment.

Regards, Pamela Lowe 10467 W Sultana Ln Garden City, ID 83714

From:	Devin Brown <devin.brown.335294013@p2a.co></devin.brown.335294013@p2a.co>
Sent:	Thursday, July 30, 2020 11:03 AM
То:	Comments
Subject:	I oppose the proposed cell tower in the Sawtooth Valley!

As someone who cares deeply about the iconic landscape of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area (SNRA), I'm concerned about the new cell tower proposed in the heart of the Sawtooth Valley on land managed by the Idaho Department of Lands (lease # M700086). Although enhanced communications for first responders is an important function, the proposed cell tower undermines the core values of the SNRA and fails to take into account possible degradation of the area's designation as the Central Idaho Dark Sky Reserve.

The proposed cell tower is three times taller than surrounding trees and in direct conflict with the core values protected by Congress when they established the SNRA. These include preservation of natural, scenic, historic, pastoral, and fish and wildlife values, and to provide for the enhancement of the area's recreational values.

The proposed tower is also adjacent to the Sawtooth Scenic Byway, located between the highway and scenic forests and mountain peaks. I am also concerned that lighting associated with this tower may jeopardize this area's unique designation as an International Dark Sky Reserve, of which there are only 12 in the world.

To date, I have not had the opportunity to have my voice heard on this project. There has been no formal public comment period nor a concerted effort to involve the local community in the lease approval process. I urge the State of Idaho to make a more deliberate effort to keep me and others apprised of this project, solicit additional comments, and develop project alternatives to address the public's concern before moving forward with this proposal.

For these reasons, I implore you to withhold approval of this lease and find ways for the State of Idaho and the applicants to work together with the public and other agencies in the community to find a more appropriate solution. Any modified proposal should provide for a reasonable public comment period.

Thank you for considering my comment.

Regards, Devin Brown 2073 S Shoshone St Boise, ID 83705

From:	Mel Kunkel <mel.kunkel.335296598@p2a.co></mel.kunkel.335296598@p2a.co>
Sent:	Thursday, July 30, 2020 11:14 AM
То:	Comments
Subject:	I oppose the proposed cell tower in the Sawtooth Valley!

As someone who cares deeply about the iconic landscape of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area (SNRA), I'm concerned about the new cell tower proposed in the heart of the Sawtooth Valley on land managed by the Idaho Department of Lands (lease # M700086). Although enhanced communications for first responders is an important function, the proposed cell tower undermines the core values of the SNRA and fails to take into account possible degradation of the area's designation as the Central Idaho Dark Sky Reserve.

The proposed cell tower is three times taller than surrounding trees and in direct conflict with the core values protected by Congress when they established the SNRA. These include preservation of natural, scenic, historic, pastoral, and fish and wildlife values, and to provide for the enhancement of the area's recreational values.

The proposed tower is also adjacent to the Sawtooth Scenic Byway, located between the highway and scenic forests and mountain peaks. I am also concerned that lighting associated with this tower may jeopardize this area's unique designation as an International Dark Sky Reserve, of which there are only 12 in the world.

To date, I have not had the opportunity to have my voice heard on this project. There has been no formal public comment period nor a concerted effort to involve the local community in the lease approval process. I urge the State of Idaho to make a more deliberate effort to keep me and others apprised of this project, solicit additional comments, and develop project alternatives to address the public's concern before moving forward with this proposal.

For these reasons, I implore you to withhold approval of this lease and find ways for the State of Idaho and the applicants to work together with the public and other agencies in the community to find a more appropriate solution. Any modified proposal should provide for a reasonable public comment period.

Thank you for considering my comment.

Regards, Mel Kunkel 8161 N Sunbelt Ave Garden City, ID 83714

From:	Samuel Baughman <samuel.baughman.335338861@p2a.co></samuel.baughman.335338861@p2a.co>
Sent:	Thursday, July 30, 2020 2:14 PM
То:	Comments
Subject:	I oppose the proposed cell tower in the Sawtooth Valley!

As someone who cares deeply about the iconic landscape of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area (SNRA), I'm concerned about the new cell tower proposed in the heart of the Sawtooth Valley on land managed by the Idaho Department of Lands (lease # M700086). Although enhanced communications for first responders is an important function, the proposed cell tower undermines the core values of the SNRA and fails to take into account possible degradation of the area's designation as the Central Idaho Dark Sky Reserve.

The proposed cell tower is three times taller than surrounding trees and in direct conflict with the core values protected by Congress when they established the SNRA. These include preservation of natural, scenic, historic, pastoral, and fish and wildlife values, and to provide for the enhancement of the area's recreational values.

The proposed tower is also adjacent to the Sawtooth Scenic Byway, located between the highway and scenic forests and mountain peaks. I am also concerned that lighting associated with this tower may jeopardize this area's unique designation as an International Dark Sky Reserve, of which there are only 12 in the world.

To date, I have not had the opportunity to have my voice heard on this project. There has been no formal public comment period nor a concerted effort to involve the local community in the lease approval process. I urge the State of Idaho to make a more deliberate effort to keep me and others apprised of this project, solicit additional comments, and develop project alternatives to address the public's concern before moving forward with this proposal.

For these reasons, I implore you to withhold approval of this lease and find ways for the State of Idaho and the applicants to work together with the public and other agencies in the community to find a more appropriate solution. Any modified proposal should provide for a reasonable public comment period.

Thank you for considering my comment.

Regards, Samuel Baughman 930 N Truckee Pl Meridian, ID 83642

From:	Brian Hickman <brian.hickman.335361919@p2a.co></brian.hickman.335361919@p2a.co>
Sent:	Thursday, July 30, 2020 3:16 PM
То:	Comments
Subject:	I oppose the proposed cell tower in the Sawtooth Valley!

As someone who cares deeply about the iconic landscape of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area (SNRA), I'm concerned about the new cell tower proposed in the heart of the Sawtooth Valley on land managed by the Idaho Department of Lands (lease # M700086). Although enhanced communications for first responders is an important function, the proposed cell tower undermines the core values of the SNRA and fails to take into account possible degradation of the area's designation as the Central Idaho Dark Sky Reserve.

The proposed cell tower is three times taller than surrounding trees and in direct conflict with the core values protected by Congress when they established the SNRA. These include preservation of natural, scenic, historic, pastoral, and fish and wildlife values, and to provide for the enhancement of the area's recreational values.

The proposed tower is also adjacent to the Sawtooth Scenic Byway, located between the highway and scenic forests and mountain peaks. I am also concerned that lighting associated with this tower may jeopardize this area's unique designation as an International Dark Sky Reserve, of which there are only 12 in the world.

To date, I have not had the opportunity to have my voice heard on this project. There has been no formal public comment period nor a concerted effort to involve the local community in the lease approval process. I urge the State of Idaho to make a more deliberate effort to keep me and others apprised of this project, solicit additional comments, and develop project alternatives to address the public's concern before moving forward with this proposal.

For these reasons, I implore you to withhold approval of this lease and find ways for the State of Idaho and the applicants to work together with the public and other agencies in the community to find a more appropriate solution. Any modified proposal should provide for a reasonable public comment period.

Thank you for considering my comment.

Regards, Brian Hickman 1175 SE Freedom Cir Mountain Home, ID 83647

From:	David Catlin <david.catlin.335738218@p2a.co></david.catlin.335738218@p2a.co>
Sent:	Friday, July 31, 2020 6:31 AM
То:	Comments
Subject:	I oppose the proposed cell tower in the Sawtooth Valley!

As a member of the International Dark Sky Society who cares deeply about the iconic landscape of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area (SNRA), I'm concerned about the new cell tower proposed in the heart of the Sawtooth Valley on land managed by the Idaho Department of Lands (lease # M700086). Although enhanced communications for first responders is an important function, the proposed cell tower undermines the core values of the SNRA and fails to take into account possible degradation of the area's designation as the Central Idaho Dark Sky Reserve.

The proposed cell tower is three times taller than surrounding trees and in direct conflict with the core values protected by Congress when they established the SNRA. These include preservation of natural, scenic, historic, pastoral, and fish and wildlife values, and to provide for the enhancement of the area's recreational values.

The proposed tower is also adjacent to the Sawtooth Scenic Byway, located between the highway and scenic forests and mountain peaks. I am also concerned that lighting associated with this tower may jeopardize this area's unique designation as an International Dark Sky Reserve, of which there are only 12 in the world.

To date, I have not had the opportunity to have my voice heard on this project. There has been no formal public comment period nor a concerted effort to involve the local community in the lease approval process. I urge the State of Idaho to make a more deliberate effort to keep me and others apprised of this project, solicit additional comments, and develop project alternatives to address the public's concern before moving forward with this proposal.

For these reasons, I implore you to withhold approval of this lease and find ways for the State of Idaho and the applicants to work together with the public and other agencies in the community to find a more appropriate solution. Any modified proposal should provide for a reasonable public comment period.

Thank you for considering my comment.

Regards, David Catlin 19662 Lenox Ave Caldwell, ID 83605

Honorary Chairperson Stephen C. Schlesinger

Honorary Board of Directors

Vice President Joseph Biden Marian Burros Edwin Friendly III Stephen R. Grant Senator Patrick Leahy Jane Stern Lebell Dr. David McCullough Senator Paul Sarbanes Richard Stallings John Fell Stevenson Maurice Tempelsman Saul Turteltaub Joanne Woodward

Board of Directors

AJ Balukoff Thomas G. Beckwith Marilyn Bickle, Vice President Melinda Blinken Jerry M. Brady William Broadhead Hollis Brookover Stephen C. Brown Christopher C. Burke, Treasurer Chase Church Nina Church-Adams Monica Church Richard C. Claussen Corey D. Cook Thomas A. Dine Curtis Eaton Fariborz S. Fatemi Steven J. Feldstein Peter H. Fenn William H. Fish Randolph C. Foster Rod Gramer Penelope (Penny) A. Gross James Grossman Russell Heller Gregory A. Kaslo Kathy Kustra Robert Kustra Larry LaRocco Donald Liebich Susan D. Mauk Joan McCarter Walter C. Minnick Michael (Pug) Ostling W. Anthony Park David L. Peterman Betty M. Richardson Richard A. Slaughter William E. Smith Lisa R. Uhlmann Garry V. Wenske, Executive Director Michael E. Wetherell Daniel E. Williams, Secretary



July 31, 2020

Idaho Department of Lands Attn: Dustin Miller 300 N. 6th Street, Suite 103 Boise, Idaho 83702

Re: Proposed Cell Tower in the Sawtooth NRA

Dear Director Miller:

Last week marked the 40th anniversary of the enactment of the Central Idaho Wilderness Act, later named for Senator Frank Church, its chief sponsor. It followed the establishment of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area in 1972, also sponsored by Senator Church. In 1997, Bethine Church and others founded the Sawtooth Society to preserve and protect the Stanley Basin area from further development. Together the Church's conservation legacy for Idaho remains unmatched.

Penelope (Penny) A. Gross
James GrossmanThat is why they would have been alarmed with the
proposed construction of a 195-foot cell tower that would
undermine the values on which Congress based the creation of
the SNRA and violate a central purpose of preserving its mountain
vistas and landscapes. Given the broad opposition to the
proposed cell tower and the availability of alternatives, I
respectfully request that the Idaho Department of Public landsPenelope (Penny) A. Gross
James Grossman
Russell Heller
Gregory A. Kaslo
undermine the values on which Congress based the creation of
the SNRA and violate a central purpose of preserving its mountain
vistas and landscapes. Given the broad opposition to the
proposed cell tower and the availability of alternatives, I
respectfully request that the Idaho Department of Public lands

Thank you for your attention.

Sincerely.

Garry/V. Wenske Executive Director



THE FRANK CHURCH INSTITUTE 1910 University Drive Boise, Idaho 83725-1936 Phone (208) 426-2941 frankchurchinstitute.org

Founder Bethine Church

Founding Members

Carl P. Burke Dr. Forrest Church Dr. John H. Keiser The Harriman Foundation Harry W. Morrison Foundation Ambassador Warren Manshel The Landau Family Bernard Rapoport Ishiyama Foundation Whitman & Ransom

THOREPT. OF LANDS AUG 05 2020 BOISE, IDAHO

From:	Corey Johnson <corey.johnson.335998319@p2a.co></corey.johnson.335998319@p2a.co>
Sent:	Saturday, August 1, 2020 9:25 AM
То:	Comments
Subject:	I oppose the proposed cell tower in the Sawtooth Valley!

As someone who cares deeply about the iconic landscape of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area (SNRA), I'm concerned about the new cell tower proposed in the heart of the Sawtooth Valley on land managed by the Idaho Department of Lands (lease # M700086). Although enhanced communications for first responders is an important function, the proposed cell tower undermines the core values of the SNRA and fails to take into account possible degradation of the area's designation as the Central Idaho Dark Sky Reserve.

The proposed cell tower is three times taller than surrounding trees and in direct conflict with the core values protected by Congress when they established the SNRA. These include preservation of natural, scenic, historic, pastoral, and fish and wildlife values, and to provide for the enhancement of the area's recreational values.

The proposed tower is also adjacent to the Sawtooth Scenic Byway, located between the highway and scenic forests and mountain peaks. I am also concerned that lighting associated with this tower may jeopardize this area's unique designation as an International Dark Sky Reserve, of which there are only 12 in the world.

To date, I have not had the opportunity to have my voice heard on this project. There has been no formal public comment period nor a concerted effort to involve the local community in the lease approval process. I urge the State of Idaho to make a more deliberate effort to keep me and others apprised of this project, solicit additional comments, and develop project alternatives to address the public's concern before moving forward with this proposal.

For these reasons, I implore you to withhold approval of this lease and find ways for the State of Idaho and the applicants to work together with the public and other agencies in the community to find a more appropriate solution. Any modified proposal should provide for a reasonable public comment period.

Thank you for considering my comment.

Regards, Corey Johnson 2306 N 30th St Boise, ID 83703

From:	Terry Bostick <terry.bostick.68517535@p2a.co></terry.bostick.68517535@p2a.co>
Sent:	Monday, August 3, 2020 9:36 AM
То:	Comments
Subject:	I oppose the proposed cell tower in the Sawtooth Valley!

As someone who cares deeply about the iconic landscape of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area (SNRA), I'm concerned about the new cell tower proposed in the heart of the Sawtooth Valley on land managed by the Idaho Department of Lands (lease # M700086). Although enhanced communications for first responders is an important function, the proposed cell tower undermines the core values of the SNRA and fails to take into account possible degradation of the area's designation as the Central Idaho Dark Sky Reserve.

The proposed cell tower is three times taller than surrounding trees and in direct conflict with the core values protected by Congress when they established the SNRA. These include preservation of natural, scenic, historic, pastoral, and fish and wildlife values, and to provide for the enhancement of the area's recreational values.

The proposed tower is also adjacent to the Sawtooth Scenic Byway, located between the highway and scenic forests and mountain peaks. I am also concerned that lighting associated with this tower may jeopardize this area's unique designation as an International Dark Sky Reserve, of which there are only 12 in the world.

To date, I have not had the opportunity to have my voice heard on this project. There has been no formal public comment period nor a concerted effort to involve the local community in the lease approval process. I urge the State of Idaho to make a more deliberate effort to keep me and others apprised of this project, solicit additional comments, and develop project alternatives to address the public's concern before moving forward with this proposal.

For these reasons, I implore you to withhold approval of this lease and find ways for the State of Idaho and the applicants to work together with the public and other agencies in the community to find a more appropriate solution. Any modified proposal should provide for a reasonable public comment period.

Thank you for considering my comment.

Regards, Terry Bostick 2933 E Springview Dr Coeur D'alene, ID 83814

From:	Savannah Meyers <savannah.joy126@gmail.com></savannah.joy126@gmail.com>
Sent:	Tuesday, August 4, 2020 11:25 AM
То:	Renee Jacobsen
Subject:	Society-Letter-May-2020-Opposing-proposed-lease-M700086-to-Land-Board.pdf
Attachments:	Society-Letter-May-2020-Opposing-proposed-lease-M700086-to-Land-Board.pdf



BOARD OF DIRECTORS

Hans Carstensen President Arlen Crouch, VP Partner Dev. Matt Engel, Treasurer Donna-Marie Hayes, VP Grants Debra LaMorte, VP Dev. Carter MacNichol, VP Admin Terry Clark, Secretary Ashley Baker Reese Mike Boren Jon Bauer Steve Botti Monica Church Mandy & Russell Clark Jeff Clegg Harvey Dale Doug Fenn Paul Hill Wayne Hughes Leon Jones Linda & Drew Lawler Jim Lyons Jenny MacNichol Jim Mitchell Patsy Nickum Suzanne Orb Helen & Ted Pardoe Pat Pettiette Keith Reese Elizabeth Tierney Wes Wills Patricia Young DIRECTORS EMERITI Robert Hayes

STAFF Kathryn Grohusky, Exec. Director Dalton Warr, Stewardship Coord. May 6, 2020

Idaho State Board of Land Commissioners c/o Idaho Department of Lands 300 N. 6th Street. Suite 103 **Boise ID 83702**

Dear Members of the Board of Land Commissioners.

The Sawtooth Society previously sent a letter dated January 27th, 2020 with comments opposing the granting of the proposed lease # M700086 for a cell tower within the Sawtooth NRA.

The proposed 195-foot tall tower, three times taller than surrounding trees, would clearly violate a central value of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area, namely preserving the landscape and viewshed. The proposed tower, if approved, will significantly and unacceptably impact the viewshed, not just from the highway but from anywhere in the vicinity. We continue to oppose the granting of the lease. Please pause the lease approval to ensure these critical points are addressed:

- It is imperative that discussions are held between AT&T and Custer Tel about possible alternatives to the new lease and a new 195-foot tower.
- It has been brought to our attention that while Custer Tel tried to initiate such a conversation • with AT&T, no substantive discussion occurred.
- Custer Tel remains willing to discuss alternative solutions to satisfy AT&T's First Net • needs, provide better cell coverage to the Redfish Lake area and avoid the need for an additional cell tower.

We urge that no new lease should be granted until conversations take place between AT&T and Custer Tel to explore alternatives to the construction of any new tower. In aid of encouraging the pursuit of such an outcome, we urge that the lease-awarding processes be paused to permit discussions between AT&T and Custer Tel.

Thank you for this opportunity to comment. I would be pleased to answer any questions you may have regarding these comments or the Society's position.

Sincerely,

cc:

Kathryn Grohusky **Executive Director**

Kirk Flannigan, Area Ranger, SNRA Steve Botti, Mayor of Stanley Jeremy C. Chou Josh Johnson

Nanette Meyers <highmtngirl@gmail.com> Tuesday, August 4, 2020 11:29 AM Renee Jacobsen Stop the Sawtooth Cell Tower

https://cdn.fbsbx.com/v/t59.2708-21/116872832_292439538867287_2968238039890404330_n.pdf/Society-Letter-May-2020-Opposing-proposed-lease-M700086-to-Land-Board.pdf?_nc_cat=101&_nc_sid=0cab14&_nc_ohc=pJKRhMupOWsAX9TEVwD&_nc_ht=cdn.fbsbx.com&oh=220700e9a 3472a14816ebefe91027f39&oe=5F29FACD&dl=1_

From:	Wyatt Meyers <wyattmeyers1@gmail.com></wyattmeyers1@gmail.com>
Sent:	Tuesday, August 4, 2020 11:53 AM
То:	Renee Jacobsen
Subject:	Society-Letter-May-2020-Opposing-proposed-lease-M700086-to-Land-Board (1).pdf
Attachments:	Society-Letter-May-2020-Opposing-proposed-lease-M700086-to-Land-Board (1).pdf



BOARD OF DIRECTORS

Hans Carstensen President Arlen Crouch, VP Partner Dev. Matt Engel, Treasurer Donna-Marie Hayes, VP Grants Debra LaMorte, VP Dev. Carter MacNichol, VP Admin Terry Clark, Secretary Ashley Baker Reese Mike Boren Jon Bauer Steve Botti Monica Church Mandy & Russell Clark Jeff Clegg Harvey Dale Doug Fenn Paul Hill Wayne Hughes Leon Jones Linda & Drew Lawler Jim Lyons Jenny MacNichol Jim Mitchell Patsy Nickum Suzanne Orb Helen & Ted Pardoe Pat Pettiette Keith Reese Elizabeth Tierney Wes Wills Patricia Young DIRECTORS EMERITI Robert Hayes

STAFF Kathryn Grohusky, Exec. Director Dalton Warr, Stewardship Coord. May 6, 2020

Idaho State Board of Land Commissioners c/o Idaho Department of Lands 300 N. 6th Street. Suite 103 **Boise ID 83702**

Dear Members of the Board of Land Commissioners.

The Sawtooth Society previously sent a letter dated January 27th, 2020 with comments opposing the granting of the proposed lease # M700086 for a cell tower within the Sawtooth NRA.

The proposed 195-foot tall tower, three times taller than surrounding trees, would clearly violate a central value of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area, namely preserving the landscape and viewshed. The proposed tower, if approved, will significantly and unacceptably impact the viewshed, not just from the highway but from anywhere in the vicinity. We continue to oppose the granting of the lease. Please pause the lease approval to ensure these critical points are addressed:

- It is imperative that discussions are held between AT&T and Custer Tel about possible alternatives to the new lease and a new 195-foot tower.
- It has been brought to our attention that while Custer Tel tried to initiate such a conversation • with AT&T, no substantive discussion occurred.
- Custer Tel remains willing to discuss alternative solutions to satisfy AT&T's First Net • needs, provide better cell coverage to the Redfish Lake area and avoid the need for an additional cell tower.

We urge that no new lease should be granted until conversations take place between AT&T and Custer Tel to explore alternatives to the construction of any new tower. In aid of encouraging the pursuit of such an outcome, we urge that the lease-awarding processes be paused to permit discussions between AT&T and Custer Tel.

Thank you for this opportunity to comment. I would be pleased to answer any questions you may have regarding these comments or the Society's position.

Sincerely,

cc:

Kathryn Grohusky **Executive Director**

Kirk Flannigan, Area Ranger, SNRA Steve Botti, Mayor of Stanley Jeremy C. Chou Josh Johnson

Nanette Meyers <nanhoops@icloud.com> Tuesday, August 4, 2020 3:44 PM Renee Jacobsen Cell tower

Dear Members of the Board of Land Commissioners,

The Sawtooth Society previously sent a letter dated January 27th, 2020 with comments opposing the granting of the proposed lease # M700086 for a cell tower within the Sawtooth NRA.

The proposed 195-foot tall tower, three times taller than surrounding trees, would clearly violate a central value of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area, namely preserving the landscape and viewshed. The proposed tower, if approved, will significantly and unacceptably impact the viewshed, not just from the highway but from anywhere in the vicinity. We continue to oppose the granting of the lease. Please pause the lease approval to ensure these critical points are addressed:

- It is imperative that discussions are held between AT&T and Custer Tel about possible alternatives to the new lease and a new 195-foot tower.
- It has been brought to our attention that while Custer Tel tried to initiate such a conversation with AT&T, no substantive discussion occurred.
- Custer Tel remains willing to discuss alternative solutions to satisfy AT&T's First Net needs, provide better cell coverage to the Redfish Lake area and avoid the need for an additional cell tower.

We urge that no new lease should be granted until conversations take place between AT&T and Custer Tel to explore alternatives to the construction of any new tower. In aid of encouraging the pursuit of such an outcome, we urge that the lease-awarding processes be paused to permit discussions between AT&T and Custer Tel.

Thank you for this opportunity to comment. I would be pleased to answer any questions you may have regarding these comments or the Society's position.

For emergencies, satellite phone or emergency beacon can be used. Hikers head to The Sawtooths to es ape their own and other's noise pollution.

Nanette Meyers Local music promoter Highlands Hollow Brewhouse



From: Sent: To: Subject: Attachments: Jessica heavin <jessicaheavin@gmail.com> Tuesday, August 4, 2020 5:31 PM Renee Jacobsen Sawtooth Cell Tower Sawtooth.doc

Attached is my letter opposing the proposed cell tower in Stanley, ID.

July 4, 2020

Christine Heavin 2180 Dora Ln Boise, ID 83702 208-631-1084

Idaho State Land Board Commission c/o Idaho Dept. Of Lands 300 N. 6th St Boise, ID 83702

Dear Members of the Board of Land Commissioners,

I'm writing to oppose the cell tower, Lease # M700006, proposed within the Sawtooth NRA.

This proposed cell tower is 195 feet tall, 3 times taller than the surrounding area trees, this would negatively impact the entire area as well as the views.

The Stanley area is part of the Dark Skies Preserve, there is no way a cell tower this size in the proposed area won't have a negative effect on the dark skies.

Custer Tel is willing and ready to discuss alternative solutions with AT&T First Net to try and reach a resolution that would satisfy the needs of getting better coverage for the entire area without impacting the scenic beauty.

I urge that no new leases be granted until Custer Cel and AT&T First Net can have a conversation to find and agree on alternate solutions prior to any construction on new cell towers in the area.

My family and I frequent the Sawtooth/Stanley area (have for generations) we still have some mining claims in the Frank Church Wilderness area. It would be terrible to have a cell tower obstructing the beautiful views.

Thank-you for your time and consideration in this matter!

Sincerely, Christine Heavin

From:	Chris H <cmhidaho@gmail.com></cmhidaho@gmail.com>
Sent:	Tuesday, August 4, 2020 5:38 PM
То:	Renee Jacobsen
Subject:	Sawtooth Cell Tower
Attachments:	Sawtooth.doc

Attached is my letter opposing the cell tower.

July 4, 2020

Christine Heavin 2180 Dora Ln Boise, ID 83702 208-631-1084

Idaho State Land Board Commission c/o Idaho Dept. Of Lands 300 N. 6th St Boise, ID 83702

Dear Members of the Board of Land Commissioners,

I'm writing to oppose the cell tower, Lease # M700006, proposed within the Sawtooth NRA.

This proposed cell tower is 195 feet tall, 3 times taller than the surrounding area trees, this would negatively impact the entire area as well as the views.

The Stanley area is part of the Dark Skies Preserve, there is no way a cell tower this size in the proposed area won't have a negative effect on the dark skies.

Custer Tel is willing and ready to discuss alternative solutions with AT&T First Net to try and reach a resolution that would satisfy the needs of getting better coverage for the entire area without impacting the scenic beauty.

I urge that no new leases be granted until Custer Cel and AT&T First Net can have a conversation to find and agree on alternate solutions prior to any construction on new cell towers in the area.

My family and I frequent the Sawtooth/Stanley area (have for generations) we still have some mining claims in the Frank Church Wilderness area. It would be terrible to have a cell tower obstructing the beautiful views.

Thank-you for your time and consideration in this matter!

Sincerely, Christine Heavin From:Rob Warburton <thedude83702@gmail.com>Sent:Tuesday, August 4, 2020 5:44 PMTo:Renee JacobsenSubject:Sawtooth Cell Oppose LetterAttachments:Sawtooth.doc

Hello, I have attached my letter opposing the cell tower. Rob July 4, 2020

Rob Warburton 2180 Dora Ln Boise, ID 83702 208-350-1459

Idaho State Land Board Commission c/o Idaho Dept. Of Lands 300 N. 6th St Boise, ID 83702

Dear Members of the Board of Land Commissioners,

I'm writing to oppose the cell tower, Lease # M700006, proposed within the Sawtooth NRA.

This proposed cell tower is 195 feet tall, 3 times taller than the surrounding area trees, this would negatively impact the entire area as well as the views.

The Stanley area is part of the Dark Skies Preserve, there is no way a cell tower this size in the proposed area won't have a negative effect on the dark skies.

Custer Tel is willing and ready to discuss alternative solutions with AT&T First Net to try and reach a resolution that would satisfy the needs of getting better coverage for the entire area without impacting the scenic beauty.

I urge that no new leases be granted until Custer Cel and AT&T First Net can have a conversation to find and agree on alternate solutions prior to any construction on new cell towers in the area.

Thank-you for your time and consideration in this matter!

Sincerely, Rob Warburton jj.hayes@att.com (208) 761-7113 Office (208) 761-7113 Mobile 5800 North Meeker Avenue Boise, ID 83713



August 13, 2020

Mr. Dustin Miller, Director Idaho Department of Lands 300 North 6th Street, Suite 103 Boise, ID 83702

Mr. Miller:

Please accept this letter on behalf of AT&T and FirstNet to provide background and additional information related to the proposed land lease for a FirstNet site near Redfish Lake as under consideration by the Idaho Department of Lands (IDL).

The Sawtooth National Recreation Area (SNRA) is a celebrated, and heavily touristed, area in Idaho. As a result, it is drawing more and more visitors to it every year. The area also includes an active, recently discovered earthquake fault line that shook loose dozens of avalanches throughout the region in early spring; it is in dense mixed forest that experiences seasonal wildfire; and it is home to one of the largest, and most heavily visited, glacial lakes in Idaho – Redfish Lake.

We are exploring the proposed new FirstNet site near Redfish Lake, intended to increase the safety of the area. FirstNet is the only nationwide, high-speed broadband communications platform purpose-built for America's first responders and the extended public safety community. Idaho's first responder community identified the area as a public safety priority in 2018 based upon the lack of existing coverage, the relative location to a large body of water, its proximity to a highway, use of the area as a staging ground for fighting wildfires, and the volume of visitors to the area. A FirstNet site near Redfish Lake would provide next-generation, interoperable communication between responding agencies during emergencies.

Bringing telecommunications infrastructure into mountainous, rugged areas is a balance. The height of the proposed FirstNet site is necessary to cover areas on and around the lake which remain a need by those responding to emergencies. We also know maintaining the aesthetic integrity of the area is important. That's why FirstNet and AT&T are working actively to ensure the visuals of the site optimally integrate with the surroundings while maintaining our focus on providing the best coverage to first responders. For example:

- 1) One Cell Site Versus Two: Through an extensive search, our network engineers and site acquisition teams identified an opportunity to locate a single cell site on IDL property that would enhance coverage typically required of two cell sites: (a) along Highway 75 and (b) on and around Redfish Lake. This single site location is adjacent to an existing provider's cell site. While this FirstNet site is 195 feet taller than the existing cell site it will extend coverage along Highway 75 to the north and south while also providing coverage at Redfish Lake, in particular the high traffic areas near Redfish Lake Lodge.
- 2) **Discrete Location:** Contrary to some reports, we are taking great care not to obscure views of the Sawtooths. In addition to being located in the same area as existing wireless infrastructure,

the majority of the FirstNet cell site will be hidden from view by a ridge when looking towards the cell site from Redfish Lake. For example, when standing at the popular north end of Redfish Lake facing the lake and the Sawtooth Range, this cell site would be over one mile *behind* the viewer to the northeast with the majority of the site hidden behind the ridge – in fact, the site will be hidden from view around the Redfish Lake Lodge.

- 3) **Camouflage Design:** Typically a cell site of this height would be a lattice-type structure. In this case, we opted for a monopole design with a slim profile. This is the preferred design given local needs and feedback we've received. Our construction team will also apply a neutral color tone to further disguise the site to blend with the surrounding area.
- 4) Dark-sky Friendly: Per FAA regulation pursuant to Title 14 of the Code of Federal Regulations, part 77.9, this planned cell site and location does not require external lighting per FAA regulation.
- 5) Exhausted Co-location Options: We have, in good faith, explored options to co-locate with the existing local telecommunications provider i.e., with a "drop-and-swap" that would allow for the height needed to cover the area and provide first responder coverage. That exploration ultimately did not lead to an alternative solution, so we resumed our application with IDL for the adjacent site.

We are committed to being good stewards while fulfilling our commitment to connect Idaho public safety. We believe our proposal meets those needs while serving the connectivity needs of the first responders who protect the lives of Idahoans and visitors to the area.

I appreciate your consideration.

Sincerely,

JJ Hayes AT&T FirstNet

From:	Kathryn Grohusky <kathryn@sawtoothsociety.org></kathryn@sawtoothsociety.org>
Sent:	Tuesday, October 20, 2020 3:51 PM
То:	Renee Jacobsen
Subject:	Sawtooth Society Opposition to Proposed Lease # M700086
Attachments:	Society Letter Opposing proposed lease # M700086 to Land Board.pdf; Society Letter
	May 2020 Opposing proposed lease # M700086 to Land Board.pdf; Society Letter
	Opposing proposed lease #M70086 #3 October 2020.pdf

Hello Renee, Please forward our letter to the Land Board. I appreciate your help with our communication. - Kathryn

Dear Members of the Idaho Land Board,

Please find three attached letters from the Sawtooth Society regarding the proposed cell tower lease in the center of the Sawtooth Valley viewshed. The first letter contains our comments on the proposal that we sent to IDL in January, 2020. The second letter, written in May, is a follow-up raising concerns about the lack of communication with AT&T and Custer Tel about possible alternative locations. The third letter is dated today and asks for a response regarding the two previous letters as well as our testimony at the July 21, 202 Land Board Meeting.

We appreciate a response to our concerns and ask for you to engage in deliberation on the community input and suggestions followed by a formal vote on the lease.

Sincerely,

-Kathryn Kathryn Grohusky ~ Executive Director

SAWTOOTH

PO Box 820 | Hailey, ID | 83333 | (208) 721 - 1495 | <u>kathryn@sawtoothsociety.org</u>



January 27, 2020

BOARD OF DIRECTORS Hans Carstensen. President Arlen Crouch, VP Partner Dev. Matt Engel, Treasurer Donna-Marie Hayes, VP Grants Debra LaMorte, VP Dev. Carter MacNichol, VP Admin Terry Clark, Secretary Ashley Baker Reese Mike Boren Jon Bauer Steve Botti Monica Church Mandy & Russell Clark Jeff Clegg Harvey Dale Doug Fenn Paul Hill Wayne Hughes Leon Jones Linda & Drew Lawler Jim Lyons Jenny MacNichol Jim Mitchell Patsy Nickum Suzanne Orb Helen & Ted Pardoe Pat Pettiette Keith Reese Elizabeth Tierney Wes Wills Patricia Young DIRECTORS EMERITI Robert Hayes

STAFF

Kathryn Grohusky, Exec. Director Becquel Smith, Operations Coord. Idaho Board of Land Commissioners 300 North 6th Street Suite 103 Boise, ID 83702

Dear Comissioners,

I am writing in response to the proposed lease # M700086 for a cell tower within the Sawtooth NRA. Please consider these recommendations prior to approving this application.

The mission of The Sawtooth Society is to protect, preserve and enhance the Sawtooth NRA. We are dedicated to preserving its open space and landscape vistas and to enhancing its recreation facilities and services.

This lease application by ATT and FirstNet to the State of Idaho (IDL) to construct and operate a commercial cell tower is located on a small parcel of State land located within the Sawtooth National Recreation Area (NRA). The proposed 195-foot tall, "galvanized grey" tower, three times taller than surrounding trees, would clearly violate a central purpose of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area, namely preserving the landscape and viewshed. This location, the grey color and the 195' height are all visually inappropriate options. The current tower at 100' and appropriately colored for its surroundings is already obvious and impacting the viewshed. A 195' tower painted in solid galvanized grey and inappropriately colored for its surroundings will significantly and unacceptably impact the viewshed, not just from the highway but from anywhere in the vicinity.

If the proposed lease # M700086 is approved, it will undermine decades of investment of public funds to protect the mountain vistas and landscapes of the Sawtooth NRA.

In 2013 when the current cell tower near the Fish Hatchery was proposed, the Sawtooth Society recognized there were benefits to having cellular coverage in the area including enhancing the safety of recreational users. At that time, the Society supported the first tower IF it addressed the following concerns. The Society felt these five attributes would minimize potential impacts to the vitally important visual and scenic resources of the Sawtooth NRA:

- 1. Minimize Tower Height
- 2. Avoid Towers Requiring Lights at the Top
- 3. Select Non-intrusive Paint Color
- 4. Construct Towers with Simplest Lattice Structure Possible
- 5. Place Tower Strategically to Minimize Visual Impacts.



The Society recommends ensuring these 5 attributes are priorities for any future structures on the state property. In addition, the Society recommends utilizing analysis of the RF propagation of a 100-foot tower vs a 200-foot tower on the site. Such research indicates a taller tower on the property does **not** provide materially better coverage. For all these reasons, a 100' tower height was the Society's recommendation in 2013 and is the Society's recommendation in 2020 and will be our recommendation in the future.

Today's application by ATT for a new tower on the State Land at the Fish Hatchery is impossible for us to support given the 195' height of the proposed tower, the likelihood of anticipated future required lighting and the lack of public input involved in the application process.

The Society therefore opposes the construction of the proposed new cell tower and requests IDL withhold approval of Lease No. M700086 until a visual impact simulation and RF propagation map is published publicly, alternate location are reviewed, an appropriate public comment period is opened, and public comments are accepted and reviewed.

The Society does support research into and future implementation of location-appropriate enhanced emergency response communications in the area. Research into enhanced communications should include the following actions by Idaho Department of Lands:

- Publicly publish a visual impact simulation and RF propagation map of proposed towers.
- Consider alternate solutions to ensure broader coverage such as co-locating on the current Custer

Telephone tower, multiple 100' towers or additional visually appropriate 100' towers at the southern end of the valley rather than installing a new 200' tower on the property.

• Ensure public input for lease <u># M700086</u> and any future cellular proposals.

Thank you for this opportunity to comment. I would be pleased to answer any questions you may have regarding these comments or the Society's position.

Sincerely,

Kathryn Grohusky Executive Director

cc: Idaho Department of Lands Kirk Flannigan, Area Ranger, SNRA Steve Botti, Mayor of Stanley Jeremy C. Chou



BOARD OF DIRECTORS

Hans Carstensen President Arlen Crouch, VP Partner Dev. Matt Engel, Treasurer Donna-Marie Hayes, VP Grants Debra LaMorte, VP Dev. Carter MacNichol, VP Admin Terry Clark, Secretary Ashley Baker Reese Mike Boren Jon Bauer Steve Botti Monica Church Mandy & Russell Clark Jeff Clegg Harvey Dale Doug Fenn Paul Hill Wayne Hughes Leon Jones Linda & Drew Lawler Jim Lyons Jenny MacNichol Jim Mitchell Patsy Nickum Suzanne Orb Helen & Ted Pardoe Pat Pettiette Keith Reese Elizabeth Tierney Wes Wills Patricia Young DIRECTORS EMERITI Robert Hayes

STAFF Kathryn Grohusky, Exec. Director Dalton Warr, Stewardship Coord. May 6, 2020

Idaho State Board of Land Commissioners c/o Idaho Department of Lands 300 N. 6th Street. Suite 103 **Boise ID 83702**

Dear Members of the Board of Land Commissioners.

The Sawtooth Society previously sent a letter dated January 27th, 2020 with comments opposing the granting of the proposed lease # M700086 for a cell tower within the Sawtooth NRA.

The proposed 195-foot tall tower, three times taller than surrounding trees, would clearly violate a central value of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area, namely preserving the landscape and viewshed. The proposed tower, if approved, will significantly and unacceptably impact the viewshed, not just from the highway but from anywhere in the vicinity. We continue to oppose the granting of the lease. Please pause the lease approval to ensure these critical points are addressed:

- It is imperative that discussions are held between AT&T and Custer Tel about possible alternatives to the new lease and a new 195-foot tower.
- It has been brought to our attention that while Custer Tel tried to initiate such a conversation • with AT&T, no substantive discussion occurred.
- Custer Tel remains willing to discuss alternative solutions to satisfy AT&T's First Net • needs, provide better cell coverage to the Redfish Lake area and avoid the need for an additional cell tower.

We urge that no new lease should be granted until conversations take place between AT&T and Custer Tel to explore alternatives to the construction of any new tower. In aid of encouraging the pursuit of such an outcome, we urge that the lease-awarding processes be paused to permit discussions between AT&T and Custer Tel.

Thank you for this opportunity to comment. I would be pleased to answer any questions you may have regarding these comments or the Society's position.

Sincerely,

cc:

Kathryn Grohusky **Executive Director**

Kirk Flannigan, Area Ranger, SNRA Steve Botti, Mayor of Stanley Jeremy C. Chou Josh Johnson

BOARD OF

Hans Carstensen, President Arlen Crouch, VP Partnerships Matt Engel, Treasurer Donna Marie Haves, VP Grants Carter MacNichol, VP Admin Terry Clark, Secretary Ashley Baker Reese Jon Bauer Mike Boren Steve Botti Monica Church Mandy Clark **Russell Clark** Jeff Clegg Harvey Dale Doug Fenn Jason Fry Paul Hill Wayne Hughes Gretchen Hurlbutt Leon Jones Debra LaMorte Drew Lawler Linda Lawler Patrick Lee Jim Lyons Jenny MacNichol Patsy Nickum Doug Obletz Suzanne Orb Helen Pardoe Ted Pardoe Pat Pettiette Keith Reese Elizabeth Tierney Wes Wills Patricia Young

> DIRECTOR EMERITUS Robert Hayes

Staff

Kathryn Davis Grohusky Executive Director

Dalton Warr Stewardship Coordinator Preserve · Protect · Enhance SAWTOOTH SOCIETY

October 20, 2020

Idaho State Board of Land Commissioners c/o Idaho Department of Lands 300 N. 6th Street, Suite 103 Boise ID 83702

Dear Members of the Board of Land Commissioners,

The Sawtooth Society previously sent letters of opposition (January 27, 2020 and May 6, 2020) regarding the proposed lease # M700086 for a cell tower within the Sawtooth NRA. In addition, we presented concerns via oral testimony on July 21, 2020 at the Land Board meeting.

We continue to strongly oppose granting this lease. The Society firmly believes the proposed 195-foot tall tower, three times taller than surrounding trees, would clearly violate a central value of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area by degrading and unacceptably impacting the landscape and viewshed.

Please ensure our opposition and the concerns of other groups are responded to and voted on. We urge you to publicly respond to our concerns and those of the Idaho Conservation League, the City of Stanley, CusterTel and others who presented oral testimony at the July 21, 2020 Land Board meeting.

It is critical to consider modifications to this proposed lease. Please do so in a public setting with deliberation and a vote.

Please contact me with any questions about our concerns and requests.

Sincerely,

Kathryn Grohusky Executive Director

cc: Kirk Flannigan, Area Ranger, SNRA Steve Botti, Mayor of Stanley Jonathan Oppenheimer, ICL Josh Johnson, ICL

BOARD OF

Hans Carstensen, President Arlen Crouch, VP Partnerships Matt Engel, Treasurer Donna Marie Hayes, VP Grants Carter MacNichol, VP Admin Terry Clark, Secretary Ashley Baker Reese Jon Bauer Mike Boren Steve Botti Monica Church Mandy Clark **Russell Clark** Jeff Clegg Harvey Dale Doug Fenn Jason Fry Paul Hill Wayne Hughes Gretchen Hurlbutt Leon Jones Debra LaMorte **Drew Lawler** Linda Lawler Patrick Lee Jim Lyons Jenny MacNichol Patsy Nickum Doug Obletz Suzanne Orb **Helen Pardoe** Ted Pardoe Pat Pettiette Keith Reese Elizabeth Tierney Wes Wills Patricia Young

> DIRECTOR EMERITUS Robert Hayes



Kathryn Davis Grohusky Executive Director

Dalton Warr Stewardship Coordinator Preserve · Protect · Enhance SAWTOOTH SOCIETY

October 20, 2020

Idaho State Board of Land Commissioners c/o Idaho Department of Lands 300 N. 6th Street, Suite 103 Boise ID 83702 DEPT. OF LANDS OCT 3 0 2020 BOISE, IDAHO

Dear Members of the Board of Land Commissioners,

The Sawtooth Society previously sent letters of opposition (January 27, 2020 and May 6, 2020) regarding the proposed lease # M700086 for a cell tower within the Sawtooth NRA. In addition, we presented concerns via oral testimony on July 21, 2020 at the Land Board meeting.

We continue to strongly oppose granting this lease. The Society firmly believes the proposed 195-foot tall tower, three times taller than surrounding trees, would clearly violate a central value of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area by degrading and unacceptably impacting the landscape and viewshed.

Please ensure our opposition and the concerns of other groups are responded to and voted on. We urge you to publicly respond to our concerns and those of the Idaho Conservation League, the City of Stanley, CusterTel and others who presented oral testimony at the July 21, 2020 Land Board meeting.

It is critical to consider modifications to this proposed lease. Please do so in a public setting with deliberation and a vote.

Please contact me with any questions about our concerns and requests.

Sincerely,

Kathryn Grohusky Executive Director

cc: Kirk Flannigan, Area Ranger, SNRA Steve Botti, Mayor of Stanley Jonathan Oppenheimer, ICL Josh Johnson, ICL

From:	Jonathan Oppenheimer <joppenheimer@idahoconservation.org></joppenheimer@idahoconservation.org>
Sent:	Thursday, October 22, 2020 4:33 PM
То:	Dustin Miller; Governor@gov.idaho.gov; Lawrence Wasden; sybarra@sde.idaho.gov; bwoolf@sco.idaho.gov; Lawerence Denney
Cc:	Renee Jacobsen; Josh Johnson
Subject:	ICL Request for a Contested Case re: Lease M700086
Attachments:	ICL Request for Land Board Contested Case Re_ Sawtooth Cell Tower.pdf



208.345.6933 • PO Box 844, Boise, ID 83702 • www.idahoconservation.org

October 22, 2020

Idaho State Board of Land Commissioners Brad Little, Governor Lawerence E. Denney, Secretary of State Lawrence G. Wasden, Attorney General Brandon D. Woolf, State Controller Sherri Ybarra, Superintendent of Public Instruction Dustin T. Miller, Director & Secretary to the Board

RE: Request for Contested Case Regarding Proposed Lease No. M700086

Dear Members of the Idaho Board of Land Commissioners:

The Idaho Conservation League (ICL) hereby respectfully requests that the Land Board include consideration of IDL Communication Site Lease M700086, proposed to be issued to New Cingular Wireless, at its upcoming regular meeting on November 17, 2020. We also hereby request that the Land Board initiate a contested case with regards to this lease.

IDL Communications Site Lease M700086 would approve a communications site lease for a 195-foot tall cellular tower proposed by AT&T Mobility Corporation, Inc. as manager of New Cingular Wireless PCS, LLC.

ICL remains concerned that the location of the proposed tower will result in significant effects to resources of the surrounding Sawtooth National Recreation Area (SNRA). In particular, as we have previously commented, the proposed 195-foot tall tower, which is three times taller than surrounding trees, is in direct conflict with the core values protected by the enabling legislation of the SNRA. The SNRA was established by Congress to assure the preservation of the area's natural, scenic, historic, pastoral, and fish and wildlife values, and to provide for the enhancement of its recreational values. The proposed cell tower, which is proposed to be located adjacent to the

Sawtooth Scenic Byway between the highway and the scenic forests and mountain peaks, is clearly contrary to those values.

Furthermore, CusterTel's analysis indicates that "a taller tower on the property does not provide materially better coverage" due to the topography of the area (CusterTel comment letter to IDL). We also continue to have serious concerns that the proposed tower could include some form of lighting in the future. The project site is squarely in the middle of the Central Idaho Dark Sky Reserve (CIDSR), designated by the International Dark Sky Association in 2017. The CIDSR is the only such designation in the U.S., one of only 12 such reserves in the world, and was awarded "Gold Tier" status - the highest ranking for night sky quality. ICL was instrumental in establishing the CIDSR and we continue to work to protect and preserve the dark sky values of the area.

The Land Board previously heard comments on the proposed cellular tower lease from the lease applicant, ICL, the Mayor of Stanley, and other concerned residents and public stakeholders at its regular meeting on July 21, 2020. Although ICL and other commenters requested that the Land Board direct the Idaho Department of Lands (IDL) to pursue negotiations with the applicant and CusterTel over alternative arrangements that would minimize impacts of the proposed cellular tower, the Land Board concluded the July 21 meeting without taking any action or providing any direction to IDL staff.

Absent such Land Board direction, it appears that IDL staff have not sought to engage with CusterTel or the applicant about alternative possible arrangements, and instead are moving forward to finalize the lease as proposed by the applicant.

ICL is very concerned that an opportunity is being missed to develop an alternative approach that meets all interests and legal mandates, such as co-locating the AT&T cellular facility with the existing CusterTel site on state lands, and/or other site locations.

ICL seeks to ensure that the Land Board is fully informed about potential impacts of the proposed lease and alternatives, and to avoid possible litigation that may result if the proposed IDL lease is approved in its current form.

To that end, ICL requests that the Land Board address this issue at the November 17, 2020 regular meeting and direct IDL to conduct a contested case hearing over the requested lease.

As defined in the Idaho Administrative Procedure Act ("APA"), a "contested case" is defined as any "proceeding by an agency . . . that may result in the issuance of an order." *See* I.C. § 67-5240. *See also* IDAPA 20.01.01.002.4 (Land Board APA rules, defining a contested case as any "proceeding which results in the issuance of an order"); *Laughy v. Idaho Transportation Department*, 149 Idaho 867, 243 P.3d 1055 (Idaho 2010) (addressing agency duty to conduct contested case hearings over requested agency approvals).

Directly relevant here is Idaho Code 58-122, which provides that the Land Board may "in its discretion, determine[] that a contested case hearing would be of assistance to the board in the exercise of its duties and authorities." *See also* Idaho Code 54-104(4) (vesting Land Board with power to "review upon appeal all decisions of the director of the department of lands in contested matters"). In addition, Idaho Code 58-132 specifically acknowledges the importance of cooperating with the federal government in administering state lands, and directs that the Land Board "determine the best use or uses, viewed from the standpoint of general welfare, to be made of state land now owned or hereafter acquired. . . ." *See* I.C. 58-132.

Given the significant concerns already raised by ICL and many others regarding the proposed cellular tower, and its impacts on visual and other values that are cherished and protected within the SNRA, it is appropriate for the Land Board to direct IDL to conduct a contested case hearing pursuant to Idaho Code 58-122, the Idaho APA, and implementing Land Board regulations in this matter.

In conclusion, ICL respectfully asks that the Land Board (a) address the proposed lease at its November 2020 meeting, and (b) direct IDL to conduct a contested case hearing over the proposed lease before rendering any final decision.

Respectfully submitted,

Jonathan Oppenheimer External Relations Director 208.345.6933 x 126 joppenheimer@idahoconservation.org

- - - - -

Jonathan Oppenheimer External Relations Director Idaho Conservation League PO Box 844, Boise, ID 83701 208.345.6933 x 126 • fax 208.344.0344 • cell 208.867.3505 http://www.idahoconservation.org • http://www.idahoconservation.org/blog Twitter: iclnaturerocks Facebook: /idahoconservationleague

Do you love Idaho? Become a member today!



DEPT. OF LANDS OCT 2 9 2020 BOISE, IDAHO

CITY OF STANLEY

October 23, 2020

Idaho State Board of Land Commissioners c/o Idaho Department of Lands 300 N. 6th Street, Suite 103 Boise, Idaho 83702

Brad Little, Governor Lawerence E. Denney, Secretary of State Lawrence G. Wasden, Attorney General Brandon D. Woolf, State Controller Sherri Ybarra, Superintendent of Public Instruction Dustin T. Miller, Director & Secretary to the Board

Dear Members of the Idaho Board of Land Commissioners,

On behalf for the City of Stanley, I provided testimony to the Land Board on July 21, 2020 in opposition to proposed lease No. M700086 for a cell tower on an Idaho Department of Lands parcel near Redfish Lake. The Land Board took no action nor provided direction to the Idaho Department of Lands on how to proceed by the end that meeting. However, the Governor's office recently stated that New Cingular Wireless was the highest bidder on this lease at a public auction, and the Idaho Department of Lands office stated that the lease had been turned over to New Cingular Wireless for execution.

I urge the Land Board to reconsider this approach at its November 17, 2020 meeting, and direct the IDL not to proceed with this lease as currently proposed. I feel that several issues that others and I raised in the July meeting have not been adequately addressed and resolved.

The proposed 195-foot high cell tower on a prominent ridge in the Sawtooth Valley will substantially impair the scenic and recreational experience of the Sawtooth and White Cloud mountains along with the historic and pastoral values of the Sawtooth Valley. This is the most iconic scenery in Idaho, inspiring residents and visitors alike. The legislation creating the Sawtooth National Recreation Area mandates preservation of the natural, scenic, historic, pastoral and fish and wildlife values along with enhancing the recreation experience. The economy of Stanley is heavily dependent on recreation and tourism, so any impairment of that experience is an important consideration to Stanley businesses and residents alike.

Idaho Code 58-132 directs the Land Commissioners to determine the best possible uses of state lands from the standpoint of general welfare, and recognizing that recreation may be one of those uses. It also recognizes the importance of cooperating with the federal government toward that end, which in this case suggests that mitigating impacts to Sawtooth NRA values and to the recreation and tourism economy of Stanley should be a primary consideration.

Recently we were informed that the IDL has altered the terms of the lease to provide that the cell tower will not be lighted at the time of construction, unless required by law. While we applaud the governor and the Land Board for recognizing the importance of protecting the Central Idaho Dark Sky Reserve (CIDSR), the decision still leaves open the possibility that lights could be added later if required by FAA. With the creation

City of Stanley P.O. Box 53 Stanley, ID 83278 Tel: 208.774.2286 / Fax: 208.774.2278 <u>www.stanley.id.gov</u> <u>cityclerk@stanley.id.gov</u>



CITY OF STANLEY

of the CIDSR in 2017, a broad coalition of stakeholders recognized night sky preservation as an essential complementary value to those already enumerated in the SNRA legislation. Those stakeholders also recognized the role of the SNRA itself as a keystone to preserving quality of life and ecosystem values throughout a broad surrounding area. The impacts of the proposed cell tower on scenic and recreational values should be viewed in the same broad context.

As we testified back in July, the best approach to minimizing the detrimental impacts of this proposed lease is a thorough analysis of alternatives. This analysis could identify an approach that meets all interests and legal mandates. Custer Telephone, which operates an existing cell tower on the same IDL parcel, has stated that the FirstNet emergency response objectives may be achievable by co-locating the proposed facility on the Custer Tel tower or through an array of shorter towers. In July we urged the Land Board to direct IDL to pursue negotiations with the lease applicant and Custer Tel over alternatives, but we have been informed that to date that has not happened, and that now the lease is ready to be signed.

Due to the controversial nature of this proposed lease, and the lack of adequate evaluation of alternatives that could mitigate unacceptable scenic, recreational and environmental impacts, we continue to oppose this project as currently proposed. We urge the Land Board to direct the IDL to withhold approval of this proposed lease and support negotiations to identify a solution that prevents degradation of the most iconic landscape in Idaho while providing necessary emergency response communications capability.

With kind regards,

Steve Botti

Mayor, City of Stanley 208-608-8739 sbotti.stanley@gmail.com

City of Stanley P.O. Box 53 Stanley, ID 83278 Tel: 208.774.2286 / Fax: 208.774.2278 www.stanley.id.gov cityclerk@stanley.id.gov From: Sent: To: Cc: Subject: Attachments: Steve Botti <sbotti.stanley@gmail.com> Sunday, October 25, 2020 1:08 PM Renee Jacobsen CityClerk AT&T cell tower lease M700086 Land Board scanned letter 102320.pdf

Renée,

I understand that the IDL has directed New Cingular Wireless to proceed with executing lease M700086 for the proposed cell tower on state lands near Redfish Lake. Please forward the attached letter to the Land Board for consideration at its November meeting.

Best regards,

Steve Botti Mayor, City of Stanley 208-608-8739



October 23, 2020

Idaho State Board of Land Commissioners c/o Idaho Department of Lands 300 N. 6th Street, Suite 103 Boise, Idaho 83702

Brad Little, Governor Lawerence E. Denney, Secretary of State Lawrence G. Wasden, Attorney General Brandon D. Woolf, State Controller Sherri Ybarra, Superintendent of Public Instruction Dustin T. Miller, Director & Secretary to the Board

Dear Members of the Idaho Board of Land Commissioners,

On behalf for the City of Stanley, I provided testimony to the Land Board on July 21, 2020 in opposition to proposed lease No. M700086 for a cell tower on an Idaho Department of Lands parcel near Redfish Lake. The Land Board took no action nor provided direction to the Idaho Department of Lands on how to proceed by the end that meeting. However, the Governor's office recently stated that New Cingular Wireless was the highest bidder on this lease at a public auction, and the Idaho Department of Lands office stated that the lease had been turned over to New Cingular Wireless for execution.

I urge the Land Board to reconsider this approach at its November 17, 2020 meeting, and direct the IDL not to proceed with this lease as currently proposed. I feel that several issues that others and I raised in the July meeting have not been adequately addressed and resolved.

The proposed 195-foot high cell tower on a prominent ridge in the Sawtooth Valley will substantially impair the scenic and recreational experience of the Sawtooth and White Cloud mountains along with the historic and pastoral values of the Sawtooth Valley. This is the most iconic scenery in Idaho, inspiring residents and visitors alike. The legislation creating the Sawtooth National Recreation Area mandates preservation of the natural, scenic, historic, pastoral and fish and wildlife values along with enhancing the recreation experience. The

> City of Stanley P.O. Box 53 Stanley, ID 83278 Tel: 208.774.2286 / Fax: 208.774.2278 www.stanley-idaho.org

economy of Stanley is heavily dependent on recreation and tourism, so any impairment of that experience is an important consideration to Stanley businesses and residents alike.

Idaho Code 58-132 directs the Land Commissioners to determine the best possible uses of state lands from the standpoint of general welfare, and recognizing that recreation may be one of those uses. It also recognizes the importance of cooperating with the federal government toward that end, which in this case suggests that mitigating impacts to Sawtooth NRA values and to the recreation and tourism economy of Stanley should be a primary consideration.

Recently we were informed that the IDL has altered the terms of the lease to provide that the cell tower will not be lighted at the time of construction, unless required by law. While we applaud the governor and the Land Board for recognizing the importance of protecting the Central Idaho Dark Sky Reserve (CIDSR), the decision still leaves open the possibility that lights could be added later if required by FAA. With the creation of the CIDSR in 2017, a broad coalition of stakeholders recognized night sky preservation as an essential complementary value to those already enumerated in the SNRA legislation. Those stakeholders also recognized the role of the SNRA itself as a keystone to preserving quality of life and ecosystem values throughout a broad surrounding area. The impacts of the proposed cell tower on scenic and recreational values should be viewed in the same broad context.

As we testified back in July, the best approach to minimizing the detrimental impacts of this proposed lease is a thorough analysis of alternatives. This analysis could identify an approach that meets all interests and legal mandates. Custer Telephone, which operates an existing cell tower on the same IDL parcel, has stated that the FirstNet emergency response objectives may be achievable by co-locating the proposed facility on the Custer Tel tower or through an array of shorter towers. In July we urged the Land Board to direct IDL to pursue negotiations with the lease applicant and Custer Tel over alternatives, but we have been informed that to date that has not happened, and that now the lease is ready to be signed.

Due to the controversial nature of this proposed lease, and the lack of adequate evaluation of alternatives that could mitigate unacceptable scenic, recreational and environmental impacts, we continue to oppose this project as currently proposed. We urge the Land Board to direct the IDL to withhold approval of this proposed lease and support negotiations to identify a solution that prevents degradation of the most iconic landscape in Idaho while providing necessary emergency response communications capability.

,

With kind regards,

M

Steve Botti Mayor, City of Stanley 208-608-8739 sbotti.stanley@gmail.com

From:	Stewart Wilder <stewartwilder@gmail.com></stewartwilder@gmail.com>
Sent:	Monday, October 26, 2020 9:36 AM
То:	Renee Jacobsen
Cc:	'Paul Hill'; 'Lin Gray, Sawtooth Association'; 'Terry Clark'
Subject:	IDL Lease #M700086 Cell Tower
Attachments:	IDL Letter 24Oct2020.docx

High

Importance:

Good morning Renee,

Please see attached letter from the Sawtooth Interpretive and Historical Association for Director Miller and the Land Board Commissioners.

Please advise on receipt. Thank you very much.

Best regards, Stewart

W. Stewart WilderPresidentLiveWilder Foundation, Idaho Suicide Prevention Coalition, Sawtooth Interpretive and Historical Association

LiveWilder Foundation 800 W Main Street, Suite 1460 Boise, ID 83702 Phone: 208.401.9263 Cell: 208.407.0842 www.livewilder.org

Idaho Suicide Prevention Coalition P.O. Box 271 Boise, ID 83701 https://www.facebook.com/IdahoSPC



SPHC Idaho Suicide Prevention Hotline	
1-800-273-TALK (8255)	ur Pathway to Sawtooth 🔒
SAWTOOTH INTERPRETIVE & HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION Preserving the Past. Protecting the Future.	Valley History PO Box 75, Stanley, ID 83278 Discover Sawtooth.org
	Facebook: @sawtoothassociation

www.discoversawtooth.org

This email has been checked for viruses by Avast antivirus software. <u>www.avast.com</u>



POST OFFICE BOX 75 STANLEY, ID 83278 WWW.DISCOVERSAWTOOTH.ORG

October 24, 2020

Idaho State Board of Land Commissioners c/o Idaho Department of Lands 300 North 6th Street, Suite 103 PO Box 83720

Idaho State Board of Land Commissioners:

Brad Little, Governor Lawrence G. Wasden, Attorney General Sherri Ybarra, Superintendent of Public Instruction Lawrence E. Denney, Secretary of State Brandon D. Woolf, State Controller Dustin T. Miller, Director & Secretary to the Board

Re: IDL Lease #M700086

Dear Members of the Board of Land Commissioners,

The Sawtooth Interpretive and Historical Association (SIHA)] respectfully requests that the Land Board include consideration of IDL Lease #M700086 that would approve a communications site lease for a 195-foot tall cellular tower proposed by AT&T Mobility Corporation, Inc. as manager of New Cingular Wireless PCS, LLC. as part of the First Responder network at its upcoming regular meeting on November 17, 2020.

SIHA has submitted previous letters of opposition to this cell tower lease due to the inability of AT&T under the direction of the Office of Emergency Management to negotiate in good faith with CusterTel for better solutions. Many other organizations, city, county, concerned citizens and search and rescue officials also share these concerns and presented oral testimony before the Land Board at its regular meeting on July 21, 2020. The Land Board concluded the July 21 meeting without taking any action or providing any direction to IDL staff for further investigation of public concerns. Instead, the lease is moving forward as proposed by the applicant as the successful bidder thereby negating any responsibility to balance income from state endowment lands to prudent and stewardship responsibilities of our public lands.

Alternatives to meet and exceed the cellular footprint throughout the entire Sawtooth valley and provide better emergency response coverage versus the lease proposal by the applicant are achievable while upholding the values of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area (SNRA) in keeping with the preservation of the natural and scenic landscape and viewshed as an international scenic, historic and recreational jewel.

SIHA is very concerned that an opportunity is being missed to develop an approach that meets all interests and legal mandates, such as an alternative of co-locating the ATT cellular facility with the existing CusterTel site on state lands, and/or other site locations.

SIHA seeks to ensure that the Land Board is fully informed about potential impacts of the proposed lease and alternatives, and to avoid possible litigation that may result if the proposed IDL lease is approved in current form.

To that end, SIHA requests that the Land Board address this issue at the November17, 2020 regular meeting, and direct IDL to conduct a <u>contested case hearing</u> over the requested lease.

As defined in the Idaho Administrative Procedure Act ("APA"), a "contested case" is defined as any "proceeding by an agency . . . that may result in the issuance of an order." See I.C. § 67-5240. See also IDAPA 20.01.01.002.4 (Land Board APA rules, defining contested case as any. "proceeding which results in the issuance of an order"); Laughy v. Idaho Transportation Department, 149 Idaho 867, 243 P.3d 1055 (Idaho 2010) (addressing agency duty to conducted contested case hearings over requested agency approvals).

Directly relevant here is Idaho Code 58-122, which provides that the Land Board may "in its discretion, determine that a contested case hearing would be of assistance to the board in the exercise of its duties and authorities." *See also* Idaho Code 54-104(4) (vesting Land Board with power to "review upon appeal all decisions of the director of the department of lands in contested matters"). In addition, Idaho Code 58-132 specifically acknowledges the importance of cooperating with the federal government in administering state lands, and directs that the Land Board "determine the best use or uses, viewed from the standpoint of general welfare, to be made of state land now owned or hereafter acquired. . . ." *See* I.C. 58-132.

Given the significant concerns already raised by SIHA and many others regarding the proposed cellular tower and its impacts on visual and other values that are cherished and protected within the SNRA, it is appropriate for the Land Board to direct IDL here to conduct a contested case hearing pursuant to Idaho Code 58-122, the Idaho APA, and implementing Land Board regulations in this matter.

In conclusion, the Sawtooth Interpretive and Historical Association respectfully asks that the Land Board (a) address the proposed lease at its November 2020 meeting, and (b) direct IDL to conduct a contested case hearing over the proposed lease before rendering any final decision.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Stewart Wilder

W. Stewart Wilder President /s/ Lín Gray

Lin Gray Executive Director

Department of Lands <no-reply@idl.idaho.gov> Friday, October 30, 2020 9:33 PM Comments Comment Submitted

From: Phillip Coonts at p.k.coonts@gmail.com Phone: 208-530-0286 Address: 23374 Travis Road City: Parma State: Idaho Zip Code: 83660

Comment:

I just read you are proceeding with the land lease for the ATT cell tower. This is the third letter I have written to protest this lease. There is already a cell tower located at the same site whose owner is willing to allow ATT to add their equipment to the tower. A no brainer!

The measly \$29,000 annual rent the state will receive is negligible. The view you are destroying is priceless. Doesn't your agency give a damn? This is Idaho! Home of beautiful scenic vistas not marred by cell towers jutting up into the sky. IDL Mission. To professionally and prudently manage Idaho's endowment assets to maximize long-term financial returns to public schools and other trust beneficiaries and to provide professional assistance to the citizens of Idaho to use, PROTECT and SUSTAIN THEIR NATURAL RESOURCES.

Sincerely, again! Phil Coonts

Department of Lands <no-reply@idl.idaho.gov> Friday, November 13, 2020 8:11 AM Comments Comment Submitted

From: Christine Hamilton at clhtlo@msn.com Phone: 2083082103 Address: 469 Aspenwood Dr City: TWIN FALLS State: Idaho Zip Code: 83301

Comment:

What the one-of-a-kind, beautiful Idaho Redfish Lake area DOES NOT NEED is another cell tower coming into view when one looks out on the irreplaceable, majestic grandeur. Please do not spoil this unique area by building a tower here. Nothing is broken, please don't try and fix it.

Erin Gatfield <eleegatfield@hotmail.com> Tuesday, November 17, 2020 12:17 PM Comments Proposed cell tower

Greetings,

I am writing to oppose the construction and placement of the AT&T cell tower in Stanley, Idaho. I understand this topic was supposed to be available for public comment in today's Idaho Land Board meeting, but it was not added to the agenda as promised. The reasons for my opposition to the cell tower are as follows:

- Custer Telephone Cooperative already has an existing cell tower near the land in question, and has offered to let AT&T co-locate on its tower. This would allow for the increased cell coverage without adding another cell tower. This saves money and resources by not having to build a new, separate edifice (Betsy Russell The Spokesman Review 11/15/20).
- The new cell tower would be an offensive eyesore to the otherwise quite pristine Stanely Basin. I was raised in Challis, just 57 miles from Stanley, and have been coming to Stanley my whole life to backpack in the mountains, float on the Salmon River, and enjoy what makes the heart of Idaho so special: its unobstructed views of the Sawtooth Mountains. Building a cell tower on the land site proposed for the new tower would permanently alter this iconic view, and mar what is otherwise a special place cherished for its rustic beauty. Idahoans value mountains and rivers that set the state apart from an increasingly urbanized world, and this cell tower would be literally and figuratively a blemish on the landscape.
- Stanley is part of the Dark Sky Reserve, and the lights of this new cell tower would further compromise
 the community's ability to claim this designation. "The Central Idaho Dark Sky Reserve is a treasured
 resource for local residents and for all Idahoans and visitors from across the world that come to
 experience the wonder of the starry night sky. The Reserve is the result of a collective commitment by
 communities, public land managers, and private landowners to support the dark sky reserve"
 (idahodarksky.org).
- Cell towers interfere with birds. "It is estimated that around 6.6 million migratory birds collide with communication towers in the US annually" (US Fish and Wildlife Service). Stanley is home to many species of birds, including Idaho's state bird, the Mountain Bluebird, the national bird: The Bald Eagle, as well as songbirds, red-tailed hawks, ospreys, and owls. Another cell tower would exacerbate the mortality of many birds in the area--and unnecessarily so!

I implore you to not only consider the objections by mayor Stephen Botti of Stanley (whom I remind you was elected to be a voice of the people), locals, Custer County Commision, Sawtooth Society, Idaho conservation League, local businesses, and Idaho residents when we say NO to this cell tower. It is not needed; it is a redundancy; and it is an affront to the pristine landscape of the Stanley basin which locals and visitors alike have cherished for generations.

Erin Gatfield

From:	April Watts <aprildwatts@gmail.com></aprildwatts@gmail.com>
Sent:	Tuesday, November 17, 2020 5:23 PM
То:	Comments
Subject:	Cell phone tower in Stanley

To Whom it May Concern:

I am writing to express my disappointment with the proposal to place a cell phone tower in Stanley that would alter the view of the Sawtooths. Considering tourism is a staple in Stanley and people come for the views of these mountains, this seems outrageous. Certainly there is another place more well-suited. Please reconsider this plan!

Dr. April Watts, LCPC 410 S. Orchard, Suite 128 Boise, ID 83705 (208) 484-7813 www.draprilwatts.com she/her(s)

The information contained in this email may be privileged, confidential or otherwise protected from disclosure. Please do not share this email without the consent of the sender. When responding, please be mindful that total security cannot be guaranteed in electronic communication.

Virus-free. www.avast.com

Department of Lands <no-reply@idl.idaho.gov> Tuesday, November 17, 2020 7:38 PM Comments Comment Submitted

From: Joshua Garcia at joshuapatrickgarcia@gmail.com Phone: 2085705254 Address: 2171 W Bella Ln City: Nampa State: Idaho Zip Code: 83651

Comment:

It is a sad day when Idaho of all states has decided to say our wild places and views are secondary to money in pockets. The idea of first responders being able to use this is great however anyone with half a brain should realize a massive corporation is only using this as a way to stuff their wallets more and they are only crying out it is for first responders. We cannot afford to compromise anymore to the things that should and have always been here.

Rod <cavalleyboi@yahoo.com> Wednesday, November 18, 2020 8:25 AM Sharla Arledge IDAHO LAND BOARD

Morning:

As a frequent visitor with family ties to Idaho, specifically North of the Sawtooth Area, I would like to denounce the proposed cell phone tower in front of Sawtooth mountains...

This area is pure natural and we the people would like to maintain this safe land to prevent big corporations from establishing business for the sake of capitalism. Sawtooth is a nature place, that allows humans to enjoy the freedom of natural planet and embrace our true existence on this planet..

If you should require any other information, please feel free to contact me..

Thank you, Rod

David T Kim <boisedave@hotmail.com> Wednesday, November 18, 2020 11:19 AM Comments Sawtooth cell tower

Dear Land Board Commissioners:

We are emailing you today to express our opposition to the proposed 195-foot high Sawtooth cell tower. Construction of this cell tower does not make sense to us. If the benefits of the proposed tower can be realized using the current cell tower, why is this second cell tower needed? From our point of view, the proposed cell tower directly conflicts with the values of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area.

Please do not authorize this cell tower.

Sincerely,

David & Susan Kim Boise, ID

From:	Annabel <panda8@q.com></panda8@q.com>
Sent:	Thursday, November 19, 2020 9:51 PM
То:	Comments
Subject:	Cell Tower in Stanley Basin

Commissioners,

I am writing to express my extreme opposition to the 195 foot cell tower you plan to place, in the Sawtooth National Recreation Area, against the opposition of every citizen of Stanley and all the community associates. That you can do this, without appeal, public input and no consideration of the effects on the environment for a measly \$30,000 is obscene!

It is especially traumatic for me, as I was raised there. My father was the ranger and I grew up in what is now the Historical Museum. I lived there when Redfish Lake was actually red from fish.

People have been going there for years because of the beauty and nature experience. To put something as ugly and obnoxious as an unnecessary cell tower there, is wrong on every level.

Just because you have the unfettered power to do this does not make it right.

Please reconsider.

Annabel van Ravenhorst panda8@q.com 208-866-8305

From:	KATHY YOUNG <kathy.young.393017098@p2a.co></kathy.young.393017098@p2a.co>
Sent:	Wednesday, November 25, 2020 1:44 PM
То:	Comments
Subject:	I oppose the proposed cell tower in the Sawtooth Valley!

As someone who cares deeply about the iconic landscape of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area (SNRA), I'm concerned about the new cell tower proposed in the heart of the Sawtooth Valley on land managed by the Idaho Department of Lands (lease # M700086). Although enhanced communications for first responders is an important function, the proposed cell tower undermines the core values of the SNRA and fails to take into account possible degradation of the area's designation as the Central Idaho Dark Sky Reserve.

The proposed cell tower is three times taller than surrounding trees and in direct conflict with the core values protected by Congress when they established the SNRA. These include preservation of natural, scenic, historic, pastoral, and fish and wildlife values, and to provide for the enhancement of the area's recreational values.

The proposed tower is also adjacent to the Sawtooth Scenic Byway, located between the highway and scenic forests and mountain peaks. I am also concerned that lighting associated with this tower may jeopardize this area's unique designation as an International Dark Sky Reserve, of which there are only 12 in the world.

To date, I have not had the opportunity to have my voice heard on this project. There has been no formal public comment period nor a concerted effort to involve the local community in the lease approval process. I urge the State of Idaho to make a more deliberate effort to keep me and others apprised of this project, solicit additional comments, and develop project alternatives to address the public's concern before moving forward with this proposal.

For these reasons, I implore you to withhold approval of this lease and find ways for the State of Idaho and the applicants to work together with the public and other agencies in the community to find a more appropriate solution. Any modified proposal should provide for a reasonable public comment period.

Thank you for considering my comment.

Regards, KATHY YOUNG 10967 W Crossbow St Star, ID 83669

From:	Donald Anderson <donald.anderson.361177186@p2a.co></donald.anderson.361177186@p2a.co>
Sent:	Thursday, December 3, 2020 10:31 AM
То:	Comments
Subject:	I oppose the proposed cell tower in the Sawtooth Valley!

As someone who cares deeply about the iconic landscape of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area (SNRA), I'm concerned about the new cell tower proposed in the heart of the Sawtooth Valley on land managed by the Idaho Department of Lands (lease # M700086). Although enhanced communications for first responders is an important function, the proposed cell tower undermines the core values of the SNRA and fails to take into account possible degradation of the area's designation as the Central Idaho Dark Sky Reserve.

The proposed cell tower is three times taller than surrounding trees and in direct conflict with the core values protected by Congress when they established the SNRA. These include preservation of natural, scenic, historic, pastoral, and fish and wildlife values, and to provide for the enhancement of the area's recreational values.

The proposed tower is also adjacent to the Sawtooth Scenic Byway, located between the highway and scenic forests and mountain peaks. I am also concerned that lighting associated with this tower may jeopardize this area's unique designation as an International Dark Sky Reserve, of which there are only 12 in the world.

To date, I have not had the opportunity to have my voice heard on this project. There has been no formal public comment period nor a concerted effort to involve the local community in the lease approval process. I urge the State of Idaho to make a more deliberate effort to keep me and others apprised of this project, solicit additional comments, and develop project alternatives to address the public's concern before moving forward with this proposal.

For these reasons, I implore you to withhold approval of this lease and find ways for the State of Idaho and the applicants to work together with the public and other agencies in the community to find a more appropriate solution. Any modified proposal should provide for a reasonable public comment period.

Thank you for considering my comment.

Regards, Donald Anderson 1420 Burrell Ave Lewiston, ID 83501

From:	Victoria Ownbey <victoria.ownbey.142829879@p2a.co></victoria.ownbey.142829879@p2a.co>
Sent:	Thursday, December 3, 2020 12:56 PM
То:	Comments
Subject:	I oppose the proposed cell tower in the Sawtooth Valley!

As someone who cares DEEPLY about the iconic landscape of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area (SNRA), I'm concerned about the new cell tower proposed in the heart of the Sawtooth Valley on land managed by the Idaho Department of Lands (lease # M700086). Although enhanced communications for first responders is an important function, the proposed cell tower undermines the core values of the SNRA and fails to take into account possible degradation of the area's designation as the Central Idaho Dark Sky Reserve.

The proposed cell tower is three times taller than surrounding trees and in direct conflict with the core values protected by Congress when they established the SNRA. These include preservation of natural, scenic, historic, pastoral, and fish and wildlife values, and to provide for the enhancement of the area's recreational values.

The proposed tower is also adjacent to the Sawtooth Scenic Byway, located between the highway and scenic forests and mountain peaks. I am also concerned that lighting associated with this tower may jeopardize this area's unique designation as an International Dark Sky Reserve, of which there are only 12 in the world.

To date, I have not had the opportunity to have my voice heard on this project. There has been no formal public comment period nor a concerted effort to involve the local community in the lease approval process. I urge the State of Idaho to make a more deliberate effort to keep me and others apprised of this project, solicit additional comments, and develop project alternatives to address the public's concern before moving forward with this proposal.

For these reasons, I implore you to withhold approval of this lease and find ways for the State of Idaho and the applicants to work together with the public and other agencies in the community to find a more appropriate solution. Any modified proposal should provide for a reasonable public comment period.

Thank you for considering my comment.

Regards, Victoria Ownbey 1430 Blue Lake Dr Hailey, ID 83333

From:	Ashton Wilson <ashton.wilson.394027032@p2a.co></ashton.wilson.394027032@p2a.co>
Sent:	Thursday, December 3, 2020 1:44 PM
То:	Comments
Subject:	I oppose the proposed cell tower in the Sawtooth Valley!

As someone who cares deeply about the iconic landscape of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area (SNRA), I'm concerned about the new cell tower proposed in the heart of the Sawtooth Valley on land managed by the Idaho Department of Lands (lease # M700086). Although enhanced communications for first responders is an important function, the proposed cell tower undermines the core values of the SNRA and fails to take into account possible degradation of the area's designation as the Central Idaho Dark Sky Reserve.

The proposed cell tower is three times taller than surrounding trees and in direct conflict with the core values protected by Congress when they established the SNRA. These include preservation of natural, scenic, historic, pastoral, and fish and wildlife values, and to provide for the enhancement of the area's recreational values.

The proposed tower is also adjacent to the Sawtooth Scenic Byway, located between the highway and scenic forests and mountain peaks. I am also concerned that lighting associated with this tower may jeopardize this area's unique designation as an International Dark Sky Reserve, of which there are only 12 in the world.

To date, I have not had the opportunity to have my voice heard on this project. There has been no formal public comment period nor a concerted effort to involve the local community in the lease approval process. I urge the State of Idaho to make a more deliberate effort to keep me and others apprised of this project, solicit additional comments, and develop project alternatives to address the public's concern before moving forward with this proposal.

For these reasons, I implore you to withhold approval of this lease and find ways for the State of Idaho and the applicants to work together with the public and other agencies in the community to find a more appropriate solution. Any modified proposal should provide for a reasonable public comment period.

Thank you for considering my comment.

Regards, Ashton Wilson 117 Victor Dr Hailey, ID 83333

From:	Garrett Ownbey <garrett.ownbey.357987920@p2a.co></garrett.ownbey.357987920@p2a.co>
Sent:	Thursday, December 3, 2020 5:11 PM
То:	Comments
Subject:	I oppose the proposed cell tower in the Sawtooth Valley!

This potential cell tower is the opposite of what the SNRA was designated for!!! Let's keep Idaho a little wild right?! You can already see the lights from Boise from the mountain tops in the Sawtooth's, let's make sure the light pollution stops there.

As someone who cares deeply about the iconic landscape of the SNRA, I'm concerned about the new cell tower proposed in the heart of the Sawtooth Valley on land managed by the Idaho Department of Lands (lease # M700086). Although enhanced communications for first responders is an important function, the proposed cell tower undermines the core values of the SNRA and fails to take into account possible degradation of the area's designation as the Central Idaho Dark Sky Reserve.

The proposed cell tower is three times taller than surrounding trees and in direct conflict with the core values protected by Congress when they established the SNRA. These include preservation of natural, scenic, historic, pastoral, and fish and wildlife values, and to provide for the enhancement of the area's recreational values.

The proposed tower is also adjacent to the Sawtooth Scenic Byway, located between the highway and scenic forests and mountain peaks. I am also concerned that lighting associated with this tower may jeopardize this area's unique designation as an International Dark Sky Reserve, of which there are only 12 in the world.

To date, I have not had the opportunity to have my voice heard on this project. There has been no formal public comment period nor a concerted effort to involve the local community in the lease approval process. I urge the State of Idaho to make a more deliberate effort to keep me and others apprised of this project, solicit additional comments, and develop project alternatives to address the public's concern before moving forward with this proposal.

For these reasons, I implore you to withhold approval of this lease and find ways for the State of Idaho and the applicants to work together with the public and other agencies in the community to find a more appropriate solution. Any modified proposal should provide for a reasonable public comment period.

Thank you for considering my comment.

Regards, Garrett Ownbey 1430 Blue Lake Dr Hailey, ID 83333

From:	Kelly Canfield <kelly.canfield.394532329@p2a.co></kelly.canfield.394532329@p2a.co>
Sent:	Sunday, December 6, 2020 3:59 PM
То:	Comments
Subject:	I oppose the proposed cell tower in the Sawtooth Valley!

As someone who cares deeply about the iconic landscape of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area (SNRA), I'm concerned about the new cell tower proposed in the heart of the Sawtooth Valley on land managed by the Idaho Department of Lands (lease # M700086). Although enhanced communications for first responders is an important function, the proposed cell tower undermines the core values of the SNRA and fails to take into account possible degradation of the area's designation as the Central Idaho Dark Sky Reserve.

The proposed cell tower is three times taller than surrounding trees and in direct conflict with the core values protected by Congress when they established the SNRA. These include preservation of natural, scenic, historic, pastoral, and fish and wildlife values, and to provide for the enhancement of the area's recreational values.

The proposed tower is also adjacent to the Sawtooth Scenic Byway, located between the highway and scenic forests and mountain peaks. I am also concerned that lighting associated with this tower may jeopardize this area's unique designation as an International Dark Sky Reserve, of which there are only 12 in the world.

To date, I have not had the opportunity to have my voice heard on this project. There has been no formal public comment period nor a concerted effort to involve the local community in the lease approval process. I urge the State of Idaho to make a more deliberate effort to keep me and others apprised of this project, solicit additional comments, and develop project alternatives to address the public's concern before moving forward with this proposal.

For these reasons, I implore you to withhold approval of this lease and find ways for the State of Idaho and the applicants to work together with the public and other agencies in the community to find a more appropriate solution. Any modified proposal should provide for a reasonable public comment period.

Thank you for considering my comment.

Regards, Kelly Canfield 3022 S Shadywood Way Boise, ID 83716

From:	Avery Gaffney <avery.gaffney.395354308@p2a.co></avery.gaffney.395354308@p2a.co>
Sent:	Tuesday, December 8, 2020 7:21 PM
То:	Comments
Subject:	I oppose the proposed cell tower in the Sawtooth Valley!

As someone who cares deeply about the iconic landscape of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area (SNRA), I'm concerned about the new cell tower proposed in the heart of the Sawtooth Valley on land managed by the Idaho Department of Lands (lease # M700086). Although enhanced communications for first responders is an important function, the proposed cell tower undermines the core values of the SNRA and fails to take into account possible degradation of the area's designation as the Central Idaho Dark Sky Reserve.

The proposed cell tower is three times taller than surrounding trees and in direct conflict with the core values protected by Congress when they established the SNRA. These include preservation of natural, scenic, historic, pastoral, and fish and wildlife values, and to provide for the enhancement of the area's recreational values.

The proposed tower is also adjacent to the Sawtooth Scenic Byway, located between the highway and scenic forests and mountain peaks. I am also concerned that lighting associated with this tower may jeopardize this area's unique designation as an International Dark Sky Reserve, of which there are only 12 in the world.

To date, I have not had the opportunity to have my voice heard on this project. There has been no formal public comment period nor a concerted effort to involve the local community in the lease approval process. I urge the State of Idaho to make a more deliberate effort to keep me and others apprised of this project, solicit additional comments, and develop project alternatives to address the public's concern before moving forward with this proposal.

For these reasons, I implore you to withhold approval of this lease and find ways for the State of Idaho and the applicants to work together with the public and other agencies in the community to find a more appropriate solution. Any modified proposal should provide for a reasonable public comment period.

Thank you for considering my comment.

Regards, Avery Gaffney 3428 N Bunchberry Way Boise, ID 83704 Pear Mr. Wasden,

We live near Stanley, moved up here in the 80s to work on a mining project. Our son & grand kids live in Meridian. They come up here and can see the Milky Way, satellites, meteors + stars they can't see in the city because of all the city light. In the summer, an astronomer from BSU comes up to Stanley & does a program, and a local amateur astronomer also has observation nights.

As a member of the state Land Board, you voted to put a 195 Feet cell phone tower right in Stanley. Our Search & Rescue says this tower will not help them. Even though that tower does not have to be tower will not help them. Even though that tower does not have to be tower will not help them. Even though that tower does not have to be tower will not help them. Even though that tower does not have to be tower will not help them. Even though that tower does not have to be tower will not help them. Even though that tower does not have to be tower will not help them. Even though that tower does not have to be airstrip. That lighted tower will mess up the wonderful educational exists to be that sky for our grandkids & future generations of Idahoans. Please save that scrap of state land for something that won't screw up an irreplaceable Idaho treasure - our dark sky.

Please !

May the kind and gentle spirit of Christmas abide with you this season.

> Sincerely, Bob + Ikelen Bryson Stanley, FD

From:	daniel roper <daniel.roper.54467554@p2a.co></daniel.roper.54467554@p2a.co>
Sent:	Thursday, December 10, 2020 10:34 AM
То:	Comments
Subject:	I oppose the proposed cell tower in the Sawtooth Valley!

As someone who cares deeply about the iconic landscape of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area (SNRA) and spend numerous hours in that area each year, I'm concerned about the new cell tower proposed in the heart of the Sawtooth Valley on land managed by the Idaho Department of Lands (lease # M700086). Although enhanced communications for first responders is an important function, the proposed cell tower undermines the core values of the SNRA and fails to take into account possible degradation of the area's designation as the Central Idaho Dark Sky Reserve.

The proposed cell tower is three times taller than surrounding trees and in direct conflict with the core values protected by Congress when they established the SNRA. These include preservation of natural, scenic, historic, pastoral, and fish and wildlife values, and to provide for the enhancement of the area's recreational values.

The proposed tower is also adjacent to the Sawtooth Scenic Byway, located between the highway and scenic forests and mountain peaks. I am also concerned that lighting associated with this tower may jeopardize this area's unique designation as an International Dark Sky Reserve, of which there are only 12 in the world.

To date, I have not had the opportunity to have my voice heard on this project. There has been no formal public comment period nor a concerted effort to involve the local community in the lease approval process. I urge the State of Idaho to make a more deliberate effort to keep me and others apprised of this project, solicit additional comments, and develop project alternatives to address the public's concern before moving forward with this proposal.

For these reasons, I implore you to withhold approval of this lease and find ways for the State of Idaho and the applicants to work together with the public and other agencies in the community to find a more appropriate solution. Any modified proposal should provide for a reasonable public comment period.

Thank you for considering my comment.

Regards, daniel roper 2556 9th Ave E Twin Falls, ID 83301

From:	Jim Loveland <jim.loveland.13307646@p2a.co></jim.loveland.13307646@p2a.co>
Sent:	Thursday, December 10, 2020 4:11 PM
То:	Comments
Subject:	I oppose the proposed cell tower in the Sawtooth Valley!

As someone who cares deeply about the iconic landscape of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area (SNRA), I'm concerned about the new cell tower proposed in the heart of the Sawtooth Valley on land managed by the Idaho Department of Lands (lease # M700086). Although enhanced communications for first responders is an important function, the proposed cell tower undermines the core values of the SNRA and fails to take into account possible degradation of the area's designation as the Central Idaho Dark Sky Reserve.

The proposed cell tower is three times taller than surrounding trees and in direct conflict with the core values protected by Congress when they established the SNRA. These include preservation of natural, scenic, historic, pastoral, and fish and wildlife values, and to provide for the enhancement of the area's recreational values.

The proposed tower is also adjacent to the Sawtooth Scenic Byway, located between the highway and scenic forests and mountain peaks. I am also concerned that lighting associated with this tower may jeopardize this area's unique designation as an International Dark Sky Reserve, of which there are only 12 in the world.

To date, I have not had the opportunity to have my voice heard on this project. There has been no formal public comment period nor a concerted effort to involve the local community in the lease approval process. I urge the State of Idaho to make a more deliberate effort to keep me and others apprised of this project, solicit additional comments, and develop project alternatives to address the public's concern before moving forward with this proposal.

For these reasons, I implore you to withhold approval of this lease and find ways for the State of Idaho and the applicants to work together with the public and other agencies in the community to find a more appropriate solution. Any modified proposal should provide for a reasonable public comment period.

Thank you for considering my comment.

Regards, Jim Loveland 1410 Freemont St S Gulfport, FL 33707

From:	Ava Worbets <ava.worbets.378002451@p2a.co></ava.worbets.378002451@p2a.co>
Sent:	Friday, December 11, 2020 2:21 PM
То:	Comments
Subject:	I oppose the proposed cell tower in the Sawtooth Valley!

As someone who cares deeply about the iconic landscape of the Sawtooth National Recreation Area, I'm concerned about the new cell tower proposed in the heart of the Sawtooth Valley on land managed by the Idaho Department of Lands (lease # M700086). Although enhanced communications for first responders is an important function, the proposed cell tower undermines the core values of the SNRA and fails to take into account possible degradation of the area's designation as the Central Idaho Dark Sky Reserve.

The proposed cell tower is three times taller than surrounding trees and in direct conflict with the core values protected by Congress when they established the SNRA. These include preservation of natural, scenic, historic, pastoral, and fish and wildlife values, and to provide for the enhancement of the area's recreational values.

The proposed tower is also adjacent to the Sawtooth Scenic Byway, located between the highway and scenic forests and mountain peaks. I am also concerned that lighting associated with this tower may jeopardize this area's unique designation as an International Dark Sky Reserve, of which there are only 12 in the world.

To date, I have not had the opportunity to have my voice heard on this project. There has been no formal public comment period nor a concerted effort to involve the local community in the lease approval process. I urge the State of Idaho to make a more deliberate effort to keep me and others apprised of this project, solicit additional comments, and develop project alternatives to address the public's concern before moving forward with this proposal.

For these reasons, I implore you to withhold approval of this lease and find ways for the State of Idaho and the applicants to work together with the public and other agencies in the community to find a more appropriate solution. Any modified proposal should provide for a reasonable public comment period.

Thank you for considering my comment.

Regards, Ava Worbets 216 N Story Book Way Eagle, ID 83616